



THE FLORIDA SENATE

SPECIAL MASTER ON CLAIM BILLS

Location

302 Senate Office Building

Mailing Address

404 South Monroe Street
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-1100
(850) 487-5237

DATE	COMM	ACTION
2/1/17	SM	Favorable
2/22/17	JU	Fav/CS
	CA	
	RC	

February 1, 2017

The Honorable Joe Negrón
President, The Florida Senate
Suite 409, The Capitol
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-1100

Re: **CS/SB 42** – Judiciary Committee and Senator Bill Montford
HB 6507 – Representative Halsey Beshears
Relief of Angela Sanford

SPECIAL MASTER'S FINAL REPORT

THIS IS A CONTESTED CLAIM IN THE AMOUNT OF \$1.15 MILLION AGAINST LEON COUNTY FOR INJURIES AND DAMAGES SUFFERED BY ANGELA SANFORD WHEN THE VEHICLE SHE WAS TRAVELING IN WAS STRUCK BY A LEON COUNTY AMBLUANCE ON SEPTEMBER 5, 2013.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

This matter arises out of a motor vehicle crash that occurred on September 5, 2013, in Tallahassee, Florida, at the intersection of North Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard (MLK Blvd.) and West Tharpe Street. The intersection of North MLK Blvd. and West Tharpe Street is four-way intersection controlled by an overhead traffic signal. Both North MLK Blvd. and West Tharpe Street are four-lane highways. On the southeast corner of the intersection there are several trees that could obstruct the view of westbound traffic on West Tharpe Street from the northbound traffic on North MLK Blvd. At the time of the accident, there was also at least one advertisement sign hung on the fence leading up the intersection that could obstruct the view of northbound traffic on North MLK Blvd. of any westbound traffic on West Tharpe Street.

The Accident

At approximately 11:28 pm, Patrick Sanford was driving north on North MLK Blvd in a 2011 Buick Enclave. Mr. Sanford's wife, Angela Sanford, was in the front passenger seat and friend, Daniel McNair, was behind Mrs. Sanford, in the rear passenger seat. The posted speed limit on North MLK Blvd. was 30 mph. At the time of the crash, Mr. Sanford was traveling at 42 mph. The light at North MLK Blvd. was green for Mr. Sanford as he approached the intersection of North MLK Blvd. and West Tharpe Street when he entered the intersection and when the crash occurred.

Also at approximately 11:28 pm a Leon County Emergency Medical Services (LCEMS) Ambulance, owned by Leon County, was traveling westbound on West Tharpe Street. Benjamin Hunter was working for LCEMS that night and driving the ambulance. Christina Wagner was also working for LCEMS that night and was the front seat passenger. The posted speed limit on West Tharpe Street was 35 mph.

The camera on the ambulance recorded what occurred before, during, and after the crash. The ambulance was first traveling at approximately 29 mph down West Tharpe Street with only its emergency lights activated. Approximately 4 seconds before the crash, and 277 feet from entering the intersection, the ambulance's siren was activated. At this time, the ambulance was traveling at approximately 40 mph. When the crash occurred the ambulance was traveling at approximately 44 mph. The video footage shows that the ambulance had a red light as it approached the intersection, when the ambulance entered the intersection and when the crash occurred.

The computer system in Mr. Sanford's Buick noted that the brake was engaged two seconds before the crash. Mr. Sanford admits that he did not hear or see the ambulance's lights or sirens before the collision. However, he recalls seeing the ambulance once he had already entered the intersection.

The ambulance hit the front right passenger side of the Buick. As a result, the Buick spun and collided with a concrete pole at on the northwest corner of the intersection.

The crash was witnessed by a number of individuals. The first witness, Ms. Nix, was traveling south on MLK Blvd., the

opposite direction of Mr. Sanford. Ms. Nix heard the sirens from the ambulance and stopped at the intersection of MLK Blvd. and West Tharpe Street because she did not know where the sirens were coming from. Ms. Nix then saw the ambulance traveling west down West Tharpe Street and the Buick traveling north on North MLK Blvd. Ms. Nix said that neither the Buick nor the ambulance stopped before entering the intersection. Ms. Nix acknowledged that she had a green light at time she reached the intersection of MLK Blvd. and West Tharpe Street but stopped because she heard the sirens.

Another witness, Mr. Fernbach, was traveling behind Mr. Sanford's Buick on North MLK Blvd. Mr. Fernbach also confirmed that the light was green as he and the Buick approached the intersection of North MLK Blvd. and West Tharpe Street. Mr. Fernbach acknowledged hearing the sirens before reaching the intersection; however, he was unable to determine where the sirens were coming from.

Ms. Wagner, the passenger of the ambulance, stated that the ambulance was headed to an accident with injuries on West Tharpe Street with only its emergency lights on. Prior to reaching the intersection of North MLK Blvd. and West Tharpe Street, she and Mr. Hunter were advised to upgrade, meaning turn on both the lights and sirens, as they traveled to the accident. Mr. Hunter then turned on the sirens of the ambulance. As Ms. Wagner was attempting to look up the report of the call they were traveling to, the crash occurred.

Mrs. Sanford and Mr. McNair do not have any memory of the crash.

All occupants of both vehicles were restrained in safety belts.

Injuries

After the crash Mr. Hunter and Ms. Wagner were able to exit the ambulance and render aid to occupants of the Buick. Mr. Hunter and Ms. Wagner were not injured in the crash.

All of the occupants of the Buick, Mr. Sanford, Mrs. Sanford, and Mr. McNair were injured. Mr. Sanford sustained a bulging disc to disc # 4 in his back and disc #5 in his back was blown. Mr. Sanford underwent surgery to repair his back injuries.

Mr. McNair suffered a cut to his right hand, a broken bone to his left, and a bone chip in his left wrist.

Mrs. Sanford sustained the most severe injuries from the crash. When she arrived at Tallahassee Memorial Hospital, she was in a coma. The totality of her injuries include:

- A traumatic brain injury (subdural and intracranial bleeding);
- A collapsed lung;
- A ruptured bladder (requiring two surgical repairs);
- A lacerated liver;
- 13 fractured ribs;
- Four lumbar spine fractures;
- Two cervical spine fractures;
- A fractured clavicle;
- A fractured sternum;
- A fractured fibula;
- A fractured knee;
- A fractured scapula (requiring surgical hardware insertion);
- A fractured pelvis (requiring surgical hardware insertion);
- A fractured hip sockets (requiring surgical hardware insertions);
- A fractured sacroiliac joints (requiring surgical hardware insertions);
- A fracture femur (requiring surgical hardware insertion);
- Double vision from an injured cranial nerve;
- Drop foot from an injured peroneal nerve;
- Bursitis and pain from the injured hip; and
- Cognitive and problem-solving deficits due to the brain injury.

Mrs. Sanford spent 25 days in the intensive care unit, and during the first two weeks in the hospital she was kept in a medically induced coma. Afterwards, she was transferred to inpatient rehabilitation in Jacksonville, Florida where she spent 31 days. Mrs. Sanford then continued her rehabilitation back in Tallahassee.

Before the accident, Mrs. Sanford was an active stay-at-home mother of three. She was considering returning to work as a

teacher when her youngest child was old enough to attend school.

Since the accident, Mrs. Sanford has made a remarkable recovery and is now able to drive during the day. She can care for her kids and her house. However, Mrs. Sanford still has some ongoing effects from the accident. She is experiencing foot drop in her right foot and double vision when she looks down. Because of the injuries sustained in the collision, Mrs. Sanford will likely need a hip replacement in the future, have issues with posttraumatic arthritis, and possibly experience further cognitive issues as a result of her traumatic brain injury.

Before the Accident

In the 24-hour period before the crash Mr. and Mrs. Sanford and Mr. McNair, the occupants of the Buick, attended a concert at the Leon County Civic Center. The day before the crash, Mr. Sanford worked the evening of September 4, 2013, and returned home at an unknown hour on September 5, 2013. Mr. Sanford believes he had only 3 hours of sleep after coming home from work on September 5, 2013.

Before the concert, Mr. Sanford had one beer at the house with Mr. McNair. Mr. Sanford admits to bringing and finishing the beer in the car on the way to the restaurant. An empty Bud Light Lime Beer bottle was found in the Buick after the collision. Mr. Sanford also admits to having one beer at the restaurant where he also ate some appetizers while waiting for the food to arrive. The food never came and they all left the restaurant without eating dinner. Once arriving at the concert, Mr. Sanford had another beer and some food because he hadn't eaten dinner at the restaurant.

In the 24-hour period before the crash Mr. Hunter worked on the evening of September 4, 2013. Mr. Hunter got home from work in the morning of September 5, 2013, and went to sleep for approximately 8.5 hours. Mr. Hunter then ate at home before reporting to work at 5 pm on September 5, 2013.

After the Accident

After the crash Mr. Sanford went to Tallahassee Memorial Hospital to be with his injured wife. While at the hospital Deputy McCarthy from the Leon County Sheriff's Office spoke with Mr. Sanford in two different locations. He first spoke to

Mr. Sanford in the hospital garage where Deputy McCarthy smelled a slight odor of an alcoholic beverage but was unable to determine if it was coming from Mr. Sanford or some other person in the garage. Deputy McCarthy then spoke with Mr. Sanford again in a private emergency room and did not smell an odor of an alcoholic beverage. Mr. Sanford was asked to consent to a blood sample since he was driving the Buick and was involved in a collision involving serious bodily injury. Mr. Sanford refused to give a blood sample for testing.

Officer Mordica of the Tallahassee Police Department was one of the first officers on the scene of the crash and noticed that Mr. Sanford was wearing a green wrist band and she smelled the odor of an alcoholic beverage, but did not notice any other signs of impairment. Mr. Sanford stated that he was given the wrist band when he purchased the beer at the concert.

A blood sample was requested from Mr. Hunter because he was operating the ambulance that was involved in a crash involving serious bodily injury. Mr. Hunter agreed to the blood sample being taken and was transported Tallahassee Memorial Hospital for the blood draw. No drugs or alcohol were found in Mr. Hunter's blood.

The Leon County's Sheriff's Department found Mr. Hunter at fault for the crash; however, the State Attorney's Office recommended that no citations should be issued. Therefore, a citation was not issued against Mr. Hunter.

LCEMS disciplined Mr. Hunter, and he was suspended without pay for three 12-hour shifts.

CLAIMANT'S ARGUMENTS:

Mrs. Sanford argues that Leon County is liable for the negligence of its employee, Mr. Hunter, when he failed to stop at the red light at the intersection of North MLK Blvd. and West Tharpe Street, violating s. 316.072(5)(b)2., F.S., and the LCEMS Standard Operating Guidelines.

RESPONDENT'S ARGUMENTS:

Leon County argues that the claim bill should be denied and the statutory caps enforced. Leon County believes that the statutory limits set forth in s. 768.28, F.S., serve a valuable purpose and the County is entitled to the full protections of the statute. Leon County argues that if the statutory caps are to have meaning or effect, they should be enforced.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

Leon County owned the ambulance driven by Mr. Hunter on September 5, 2013, and is covered by the provisions of s. 768.28, F.S. Section 768.28, F.S., generally allows injured parties to sue the state or local governments for damages caused by their negligence or the negligence of their employees by waiving the government's sovereign immunity from tort action. However, the statute limits the amount of damages that a plaintiff can collect from a judgment against or settlement with a government entity to \$200,000 per person and \$300,000 for all claims or judgments arising out of the same incident. Funds can be paid in excess of these limits only upon the approval of a claim bill by the Legislature. Thus, Mrs. Sanford will not receive the full benefit of the settlement agreement with Leon County unless the Legislature approves a claim bill authorizing the additional payment.

In a negligence action a plaintiff, bears the burden of proof to establish the four elements of negligence. These elements are duty, breach, causation, and damage. *Charron v. Birge*, 37 So.3d 292, 296 (Fla. 5th DCA 2010).

Section 768.81, F.S., Florida's comparative fault statute, allows damages in negligence cases to be apportioned against each liable party. The Florida Supreme Court has found that "in determining noneconomic damages fault must be apportioned among all responsible entities who contribute to an accident even though not all of them have been joined at defendants." *Nash v. Wells Fargo Guard Servs.*, 678 So.2d 1262, 1263 (Fla. 1996).

The driver of a motor vehicle has a duty to use reasonable care, in light of the attendant circumstances, to prevent injuring persons within the vehicle's path. *Gowdy v. Bell*, 993 So.2d 585, 586 (Fla. 1st DCA 2008). Reasonable care is the degree of care a reasonably careful person would have used under like circumstances. *Foster v. State*, 603 So.2d 1312, 1316 (Fla. 1st DCA 1992).

Mr. Hunter's Negligence

Section 316.072(5)(b)2., F.S., allows a driver of an ambulance, when responding to an emergency call, to proceed past a red or stop signal or stop sign, but only after slowing down as may be necessary for safe operation. Section 316.072(5)(c), F.S., reiterates that the driver of an

ambulance has a duty to drive with due regard for the safety of all persons and does not protect the driver from the consequences of his or her reckless disregard for the safety of others.

Mr. Hunter breached his duty to operate the ambulance with reasonable care and violated s. 316.072(5)(b)2., F.S., when he did not slow down at the red light at the intersection of North MLK Blvd. and West Tharpe Street on September 5, 2013. Mr. Hunter's negligence and breach of duty of care was a cause of the accident and the damages suffered by Mrs. Sanford.

Leon County, as the employer of Mr. Hunter, is liable for his negligent act. The long-standing doctrine of *respondeat superior* provides that an employer is liable for an employee's acts committed within the course and scope of employment. *City of Boynton Beach v. Weiss*, 120 So.3d 606, 611 (Fla. 4th DCA 2013). Florida's dangerous instrumentality imposes "vicarious liability upon the owner of a motor vehicle who voluntarily entrusts that motor vehicle to an individual whose negligent operation causes damage to another." *Aurbach v. Gallina*, 753 So.2d 60, 62 (Fla. 2000). Motor vehicles have been considered dangerous instrumentalities under Florida law for over a century. See *Anderson v. S. Cotton Oil Co.*, 74 So. 975, 978 (Fla.1917).

Florida law also provides that an employer's safety rules and procedures governing the conduct of its employees is relevant evidence of the standard of care required. *Mayo v. Publix*, 686 So.2d. 801, 802 (Fla. 4th DCA 1997). LCEMS has Standard Operating Guidelines for the safe operation of its vehicles. Specifically, the guidelines require all ambulance drivers when driving to an emergency to come to a full and complete stop at all red lights and stop signs. Once the driver determines that all other traffic has yielded to the emergency vehicle, the ambulance may proceed through the intersection with due regard for the safety of others.

Mr. Hunter violated LCEMS Standard Operating Guidelines when he did not stop at the red light at the intersection of North MLK Blvd. and West Tharpe Street.

On September 5, 2013, Mr. Hunter, an employee of LCEMS, drove an ambulance owned by Leon County during the

course of his normal workday. Therefore, Leon County is liable for the negligence of Mr. Hunter and the damages caused to Mrs. Sanford.

Mr. Sanford's Negligence

As the driver of the Buick, Mr. Sanford also had a duty to use reasonable care. Section 316.126(1)(a), F.S. provides:

Upon the immediate approach of an authorized emergency vehicle, while en route to meet an existing emergency, the driver of every other vehicle shall, when such emergency vehicle is giving audible signals by siren ... or visible signals by the use of displayed blue or red lights, yield the right-of way to the emergency vehicle and shall immediately proceed to a position of parallel to, and as close as reasonable to the closest edge of the curb of the roadway, clear of any intersection and shall stop and remain in position until the authorized emergency vehicle has passed, unless otherwise directed by a law enforcement officer.

On the day of the accident, the trees and signs could have obstructed Mr. Sanford's view of the ambulance, which was traveling westbound on West Tharpe Street. The ambulance's siren was activated 4 seconds before the collision which likely did not afford Mr. Sanford adequate time react and avoid the collision. Moreover, the evidence presented was insufficient to show that the three beers Mr. Sanford consumed in the hours before the accident or his lack of sleep contributed to the accident.

However, Mr. Sanford was traveling at 42 mph down at the time of the crash, 12 mph faster than the posted speed limit of 30 mph. Mr. Sanford breached his duty to drive with reasonable care by failing to stop for the ambulance because of his excessive speed. Despite the fact that he had a green light at the intersection, Mr. Sanford is partially at fault for the accident.

Section 316.126(5), F.S., specifies that s. 316.126, F.S., which Mr. Sanford violated, does not relieve the Mr. Hunter of the duty to drive with due regard for the safety of all persons using the highway, which he did failed to do.

Conclusion

Florida's comparative fault statute, s. 768.81, F.S., applies to this case because Mr. Hunter and Mr. Sanford were both at fault in the accident.

Mr. Hunter is at fault for:

- Failing to operate the ambulance with reasonable care;
- Violating s. 316.072(5)(b)2., F.S., when he did not slow down at the red light; and
- Violating LCEMS Standard Operating Guidelines when he did not stop at the red light at the intersection.

Mr. Sanford is at fault for:

- Violating s. 316.126(1)(a), F.S., by failing to stop for the ambulance because of his excessive speed.

While both Mr. Hunter and Mr. Sanford were partially at fault in this matter, Mr. Hunter's negligence far outweighs Mr. Sanford's negligence.

Mrs. Sanford suffered substantial injuries as a result of Mr. Hunter's negligence and has outstanding medical bills because of these injuries. Mrs. Sanford has made a remarkable recovery but still has some ongoing effects from the accident. Mrs. Sanford experiences foot drop in her right foot and double vision when she looks down. Because of the injuries sustained in the collision, Mrs. Sanford will likely need a hip replacement in the future, have issues with posttraumatic arthritis, and possibly experience further cognitive issues as a result of her traumatic brain injury. Mrs. Sanford may have a reduced future earning capacity because of her ongoing physical impairments. She will likely have future medical expenses as a direct result of the accident. Therefore, the undersigned finds that the damages of \$1.15 million sought by Mrs. Sanford are reasonable and justly apportionable to Leon County as a result of Mr. Hunter's negligence.

The parties participated in mediation and reached a Mediation Settlement Agreement for \$1.15 million, the same amount as the claim bill. A Final Judgment in favor of Mrs. Sanford for the \$1.15 million was signed and entered into the circuit court's record on April 13, 2015. The Mediation

Settlement Agreement afforded Mrs. Sanford the right to pursue a claim bill from the legislature for \$1.15 million and also allowed Leon County the right to contest any filed claim bill.

At the Special Master Hearing attorneys for both parties agreed that all evidence and arguments presented at the hearing were also taken into consideration at mediation. The attorneys also agreed that no new evidence was presented to the undersigned at the hearing.

The undersigned finds that at mediation the parties presented all of the facts and arguments described above. The parties also took into account the fault of Mr. Hunter and Mr. Sanford as well as Mrs. Sanford's recovery and her future medical needs. Therefore, the undersigned finds that the Mediation Settlement Agreement was both reasonable and responsible.

LEGISLATIVE HISTORY:

A claim bill for the relief of Angela Sanford was first filed for the 2016 Legislative Session. The Senate Bill, SB 22 (2016) died on the Calendar, and the House companion HB 3511 (2016) was not heard by a committee.

FISCAL IMPACT:

Leon County is insured and has received no indication from its insurer that the entire amount of the claim bill, if passed, will not be paid.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

For the reasons set forth above, the undersigned recommends that Senate Bill 42 (2017) be reported FAVORABLY.

Respectfully submitted,

Lauren Jones
Senate Special Master

cc: Secretary of the Senate

CS by Judiciary:

The committee substitute, in conformity with a recent opinion of the Florida Supreme Court, does not include the limits on costs, lobbying fees, and other similar expenses, which were included in the original bill.