# The Florida Senate BILL ANALYSIS AND FISCAL IMPACT STATEMENT

(This document is based on the provisions contained in the legislation as of the latest date listed below.)

		Pi	epared By: The Profession	al Staff of the Comr	nittee on Rules
BI	LL:	SB 7018			
INTRODUCER:		Education Committee			
SUBJECT:		OGSR/Public Research Facility/Animal Research			
DATE:		March 12,	2019 REVISED:		
ANALY Olenick		YST	STAFF DIRECTOR	REFERENCE	ACTION
		Sikes			ED Submitted as Committee Bill
1.	Ponder		McVaney	GO	Favorable
2.	Olenick		Phelps		Favorable

## I. Summary:

SB 7018 saves from repeal a public records exemption for personal identifying information of a person employed by, under contract with, or volunteering for a public research facility, including a state university that conducts animal research or is engaged in activities related to animal research. Such information is exempt from public records disclosure requirements when the information is contained in the following records:

- Animal records, including animal care and treatment records.
- Research protocols and approvals.
- Purchase and billing records related to animal research or activities.
- Animal care and committee records.
- Facility and laboratory records related to animal research or activities.

The public records exemption is subject to the Open Government Sunset Review Act and stands repealed on October 2, 2019, unless reviewed and saved from repeal by the Legislature. The bill removes the repeal date to continue the public records exemption for personal identifying information of a person employed, under contract with, or volunteering for a public research facility.

The bill takes effect October 1, 2019.

## II. Present Situation:

### **Public Records Law**

The Florida Constitution provides that the public has the right to inspect or copy records made or received in connection with official governmental business.<sup>1</sup> This applies to the official business

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> FLA. CONST., art. I, s. 24(a).

of any public body, officer, or employee of the state, including all three branches of state government, local governmental entities, and any person acting on behalf of the government.<sup>2</sup>

Chapter 119, F.S., known as the Public Records Act, constitutes the main body of public records laws.<sup>3</sup> The Public Records Act states that

[i]t is the policy of this state that all state, county, and municipal records are open for personal inspection and copying by any person. Providing access to public records is a duty of each agency.<sup>4</sup>

The Public Records Act typically contains general exemptions that apply across agencies. Agency- or program-specific exemptions often are placed in the substantive statutes relating to that particular agency or program.

The Public Records Act does not apply to legislative or judicial records.<sup>5</sup> Legislative records are public pursuant to s. 11.0431, F.S. Public records exemptions for the Legislature are codified primarily in s. 11.0431(2)-(3), F.S., and adopted in the rules of each house of the legislature.

A public record includes virtually any document or recording, regardless of its physical form or how it may be transmitted.<sup>6</sup> The Florida Supreme Court has interpreted public records as being "any material prepared in connection with official agency business which is intended to perpetuate, communicate, or formalize knowledge of some type."<sup>7</sup>

The Florida Statutes specify conditions under which public access to governmental records must be provided. The Public Records Act guarantees every person's right to inspect and copy any state or local government public record at any reasonable time, under reasonable conditions, and under supervision by the custodian of the public record.<sup>8</sup> A violation of the Public Records Act may result in civil or criminal liability.<sup>9</sup>

Only the Legislature may create an exemption to public records requirements.<sup>10</sup> An exemption must be created by general law and must specifically state the public necessity justifying the

<sup>10</sup> FLA. CONST., art. I, s. 24(c).

 $<sup>^{2}</sup>$  Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Public records laws are found throughout the Florida Statutes.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Section 119.01(1), F.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Locke v. Hawkes, 595 So. 2d 32 (Fla. 1992). Also see Times Pub. Co. v. Ake, 660 So. 2d 255 (Fla. 1995).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Section 119.011(12), F.S., defines "public record" to mean "all documents, papers, letters, maps, books, tapes, photographs, films, sound recordings, data processing software, or other material, regardless of the physical form, characteristics, or means of transmission, made or received pursuant to law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business by any agency." Section 119.011(2), F.S., defines "agency" as "any state, county, district, authority, or municipal officer, department, division, board, bureau, commission, or other separate unit of government created or established by law including, for the purposes of this chapter, the Commission on Ethics, the Public Service Commission, and the Office of Public Counsel, and any other public or private agency, person, partnership, corporation, or business entity acting on behalf of any public agency."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Shevin v. Byron, Harless, Schaffer, Reid and Assoc. Inc., 379 So. 2d 633, 640 (Fla. 1980).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Section 119.07(1)(a), F.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Section 119.10, F.S. Public records laws are found throughout the Florida Statutes, as are the penalties for violating those laws.

exemption.<sup>11</sup> Further, the exemption must be no broader than necessary to accomplish the stated purpose of the law. A bill enacting an exemption may not contain other substantive provisions<sup>12</sup> and must pass by a two-thirds vote of the members present and voting in each house of the Legislature.<sup>13</sup>

When creating or expanding a public records exemption, the Legislature may provide that a record is 'confidential and exempt' or 'exempt.'<sup>14</sup> Records designated as 'confidential and exempt' may be released by the records custodian only under the circumstances defined by the Legislature or pursuant to a court order. Records designated as 'exempt' may be released at the discretion of the records custodian under certain circumstances.<sup>15</sup>

## **Open Government Sunset Review Act**

The Open Government Sunset Review Act (the Act) prescribes a legislative review process for newly created or substantially amended public records or open meetings exemptions,<sup>16</sup> with specified exceptions.<sup>17</sup> The Act provides that an exemption automatically repeals on October 2nd of the fifth year after creation or substantial amendment; in order to save an exemption from repeal, the Legislature must reenact the exemption or repeal the sunset date.<sup>18</sup> In practice, many exemptions are continued by repealing the sunset date rather than reenacting the exemption.

The Act provides that a public records or open meetings exemption may be created or maintained only if it serves an identifiable public purpose and is no broader than is necessary.<sup>19</sup> An exemption serves an identifiable purpose if it meets one of the following purposes *and* the Legislature finds that the purpose of the exemption outweighs open government policy and cannot be accomplished without the exemption:

- It allows the state or its political subdivision to effectively and efficiently administer a program, and administration would be significantly impaired without the exemption;<sup>20</sup>
- Releasing sensitive personal information would be defamatory or would jeopardize an individual's safety. If this public purpose is cited as the basis of an exemption, however, only personal identifying information is exempt;<sup>21</sup> or
- It protects trade or business secrets.<sup>22</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> The bill may, however, contain multiple exemptions that relate to one subject.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> FLA. CONST., art. I, s. 24(c)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> If the Legislature designates a record as confidential, such record may not be released to anyone other than the persons or entities specifically designated in the statutory exemption. *WFTV, Inc. v. The School Board of Seminole*, 874 So. 2d 48 (Fla. 5th DCA 2004).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Williams v. City of Minneola, 575 So. 2d 683 (Fla. 5th DCA 1991).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Section 119.15, F.S. Section 119.15(4)(b), F.S., provides that an exemption is considered to be substantially amended if it is expanded to include more records or information or to include meetings.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Section 119.15(2)(a) and (b), F.S., provide that exemptions that are required by federal law or are applicable solely to the Legislature or the State Court System are not subject to the Open Government Sunset Review Act.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Section 119.15(3), F.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Section 119.15(6)(b), F.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Section 119.15(6)(b)1., F.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Section 119.15(6)(b)2., F.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Section 119.15(6)(b)3., F.S.

The Act also requires specified questions to be considered during the review process.<sup>23</sup> In examining an exemption, the Act directs the Legislature to carefully question the purpose and necessity of reenacting the exemption.

If, in reenacting an exemption or repealing the sunset date, the exemption is expanded, then a public necessity statement and a two-thirds vote for passage are required.<sup>24</sup> If the exemption is reenacted or saved from repeal without substantive changes or if the exemption is narrowed, then a public necessity statement and a two-thirds vote for passage are *not* required. If the Legislature allows an exemption to sunset, the previously exempt records will remain exempt unless provided for by law.<sup>25</sup>

# **Animal Research Public Records Exemption**

Section 585.611, F.S., provides an exemption from public record disclosure requirements for personal identifying information of a person employed by, under contract with, or volunteering for a public research facility that conducts animal research or is engaged in activities related to animal research. Such personal identifying information is exempt from the provisions of s. 119.07(1), F.S., and s. 24(a), Art. I of the Florida Constitution when it is contained in the following records:

- Animal records, including animal care and treatment records;
- Research protocols and approvals;
- Purchasing, funding, and billing records related to animal research or activities;
- Animal care and use committee records;
- Facility and laboratory records related to animal research or activities.

Section 585.611, F.S., provides for future review and repeal of the public records exemption on October 2, 2019.

Chapter 2014-37, L.O.F., included a public necessity statement that provided rational for the exemption. This rationale recognized that the release of such personal identifying information will place such persons in danger of threats and harassment as well as physical and emotional harm from those who advocate against such research.

# **Open Government Sunset Review Findings and Recommendations**

In August 2018, the Senate Education Committee and the House Oversight, Transparency & Administration Subcommittee, in consultation with the Department of Education and Florida

• Whom does the exemption uniquely affect, as opposed to the general public?

• Can the information contained in the records or discussed in the meeting be readily obtained by alternative means? If so, how?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Section 119.15(6)(a), F.S. The specified questions are:

<sup>•</sup> What specific records or meetings are affected by the exemption?

<sup>•</sup> What is the identifiable public purpose or goal of the exemption?

<sup>•</sup> Is the record or meeting protected by another exemption?

<sup>•</sup> Are there multiple exemptions for the same type of record or meeting that it would be appropriate to merge?

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 24}$  FLA. CONST. art. I, s. 24(c).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Section 119.15(7), F.S.

Board of Governors office, sent an Open Government Sunset Review Questionnaire to public research facilities at public colleges and universities throughout the state regarding the need to maintain the exemption related to persons employed by, under contract with, or volunteering for a public research facility that conducts animal research or is engaged in activities related to animal research.

Nine state universities and one college returned the questionnaire. Of those, seven institutions recommended the exemption be reenacted for safety and to ensure further participation in the field. Two institutions deferred or did not provide a recommendation, and one recommended that the exemption be made both confidential and exempt. The research focus of these institutions includes scientific discovery, population studies, cancer research, Alzheimer's research, and the study of other debilitating diseases. These institutions work to advance scientific knowledge and treatment with applied research ultimately leading to cures and innovation in health and biomedical fields. The responses state that the exemption is necessary to maintain the effective and efficient administration of public research facilities and protect the safety of those employed by, under contract with, or volunteering at these facilities.

# III. Effect of Proposed Changes:

The bill continues the current public records exemption relating to personal identifying information of a person employed by, under contract with, or volunteering for a public research facility, including a state university that conducts or is engaged in activities related to animal research by deleting its scheduled repeal date. The exemption is scheduled for repeal on October 2, 2019.

The bill takes effect October 1, 2019.

## IV. Constitutional Issues:

A. Municipality/County Mandates Restrictions:

None.

B. Public Records/Open Meetings Issues:

## Vote Requirement

Article I, s. 24(c) of the State Constitution requires a two-thirds vote of the members present and voting for final passage of a bill creating or expanding an exemption to the public records requirements. This bill continues a current public records exemption beyond its current date of repeal; thus, the bill does not require an extraordinary vote for enactment.

## **Public Necessity Statement**

Article I, s. 24(c) of the State Constitution requires a bill creating or expanding an exemption to the public records requirements to state with specificity the public necessity justifying the exemption. This bill continues a current public records exemption without expansion. Thus, a statement of public necessity is not required.

#### Page 6

### **Breadth of Exemption**

Article I, s. 24(c) of the State Constitution requires an exemption to the public records requirements to be no broader than necessary to accomplish the stated purpose of the law. The purpose of the law is to protect personal identifying information of those who are employed by, under contract with, volunteering or engaged in activities related to animal research. This bill exempts only personal identifying information from the public records requirements. The exemption does not appear to be broader than necessary to accomplish the purpose of the law.

C. Trust Funds Restrictions:

None.

D. State Tax or Fee Increases:

None.

E. Other Constitutional Issues:

None.

## V. Fiscal Impact Statement:

A. Tax/Fee Issues:

None.

B. Private Sector Impact:

The private sector will continue to be subject to the cost, to the extent imposed, associated with the public research facility making redactions in response to the public records request.

### C. Government Sector Impact:

Public research facilities will continue to incur costs related to the redaction of records in response to public record requests.

### VI. Technical Deficiencies:

None.

### VII. Related Issues:

None.

# VIII. Statutes Affected:

This bill substantially amends section 585.611 of the Florida Statutes.

# IX. Additional Information:

### A. Committee Substitute – Statement of Changes: (Summarizing differences between the Committee Substitute and the prior version of the bill.)

None.

### B. Amendments:

None.

This Senate Bill Analysis does not reflect the intent or official position of the bill's introducer or the Florida Senate.