1 A bill to be entitled 2 An act relating to jury recommendations in death 3 penalty cases; amending ss. 921.141 and 921.142, F.S.; 4 providing for jury recommendations concerning death 5 sentences, rather than jury determinations of 6 sentences; specifying that a jury recommends a death 7 sentence if at least eight jurors recommend a death 8 sentence; specifying that a jury recommends a sentence 9 of life imprisonment without the possibility of parole if fewer than eight jurors recommend a death sentence; 10 11 requiring the sentencing court to set forth in writing 12 specified findings if it imposes a death sentence; 13 providing an effective date.

1415

Be It Enacted by the Legislature of the State of Florida:

1617

18

Section 1. Subsections (1), (2), and (3) of section 921.141, Florida Statutes, are amended to read:

1920

21

921.141 Sentence of death or life imprisonment for capital felonies; further proceedings to determine sentence.—

222324

25

(1) SEPARATE PROCEEDINGS ON ISSUE OF PENALTY.—Upon conviction or adjudication of guilt of a defendant of a capital felony, the court shall conduct a separate sentencing proceeding to determine whether the defendant should be sentenced to death or life imprisonment as authorized by s. 775.082. The proceeding

Page 1 of 10

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

3839

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

shall be conducted by the trial judge before the trial jury as soon as practicable, if the defendant has not waived his or her right to a sentencing recommendation by a jury. If, through impossibility or inability, the trial jury is unable to reconvene for a hearing on the issue of penalty, having determined the quilt of the accused, the trial judge may summon a special juror or jurors as provided in chapter 913 to make a recommendation as to determine the issue of the imposition of the penalty. If the trial jury has been waived, or if the defendant pleaded guilty, the sentencing proceeding shall be conducted before a jury impaneled for that purpose, unless waived by the defendant. In the proceeding, evidence may be presented as to any matter that the court deems relevant to the nature of the crime and the character of the defendant and shall include matters relating to any of the aggravating factors enumerated in subsection (6) and for which notice has been provided pursuant to s. 782.04(1)(b) or mitigating circumstances enumerated in subsection (7). Any such evidence that the court deems to have probative value may be received, regardless of its admissibility under the exclusionary rules of evidence, provided the defendant is accorded a fair opportunity to rebut any hearsay statements. However, this subsection shall not be construed to authorize the introduction of any evidence secured in violation of the Constitution of the United States or the Constitution of the State of Florida. The state and the

Page 2 of 10

defendant or the defendant's counsel shall be permitted to present argument for or against sentence of death.

- (2) FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDED SENTENCE BY THE JURY.-
- (a) This subsection applies only if the defendant has not waived his or her right to a sentencing <u>recommendation</u> proceeding by a jury.
- (b) After hearing all the evidence, the jury shall deliberate and render an advisory sentence to the court, based upon the following matters:
- 1. Whether sufficient aggravating factors exist as enumerated in subsection (6). A finding that an aggravating factor exists must be unanimous.
- 2. Whether sufficient mitigating circumstances exist which outweigh the aggravating factors found to exist.
- 3. Based on these considerations, whether the defendant should be sentenced to life imprisonment or death.
- (c) If at least eight jurors determine that the defendant should be sentenced to death, the jury's recommendation to the court shall be a sentence of death. If fewer than eight jurors determine that the defendant should be sentenced to death, the jury's recommendation to the court shall be a sentence of life imprisonment without the possibility of parole.
- (3) FINDINGS IN SUPPORT OF SENTENCE OF DEATH.—

 Notwithstanding the recommendation of the jury, the court, after weighing the aggravating and mitigating circumstances, shall

Page 3 of 10

enter a sentence of life imprisonment or death, but if the court imposes a sentence of death, it shall set forth in writing its findings upon which the sentence of death is based as to the facts:

(a) That sufficient aggravating factors exist as enumerated in subsection (6).

- (b) That there are insufficient mitigating circumstances to outweigh the aggravating factors.
- (a) After hearing all of the evidence presented regarding aggravating factors and mitigating circumstances, the jury shall deliberate and determine if the state has proven, beyond a reasonable doubt, the existence of at least one aggravating factor set forth in subsection (6).
- (b) The jury shall return findings identifying each aggravating factor found to exist. A finding that an aggravating factor exists must be unanimous. If the jury:
- 1. Does not unanimously find at least one aggravating factor, the defendant is ineligible for a sentence of death.
- 2. Unanimously finds at least one aggravating factor, the defendant is eligible for a sentence of death and the jury shall make a recommendation to the court as to whether the defendant shall be sentenced to life imprisonment without the possibility of parole or to death. The recommendation shall be based on a weighing of all of the following:
 - a. Whether sufficient aggravating factors exist.

Page 4 of 10

101 b. Whether aggravating factors exist which outweigh the 102 mitigating circumstances found to exist. 103 c. Based on the considerations in sub-subparagraphs a. and b., whether the defendant should be sentenced to life 104 105 imprisonment without the possibility of parole or to death. 106 (c) If a unanimous jury determines that the defendant 107 should be sentenced to death, the jury's recommendation to the 108 court shall be a sentence of death. If a unanimous jury does not 109 determine that the defendant should be sentenced to death, the 110 jury's recommendation to the court shall be a sentence of life 111 imprisonment without the possibility of parole. 112 (3) IMPOSITION OF SENTENCE OF LIFE IMPRISONMENT OR DEATH.-113 (a) If the jury has recommended a sentence of: 114 1. Life imprisonment without the possibility of parole, 115 the court shall impose the recommended sentence. 116 2. Death, the court, after considering each aggravating 117 factor found by the jury and all mitigating circumstances, may 118 impose a sentence of life imprisonment without the possibility 119 a sentence of death. The court may consider 120 aggravating factor that was unanimously found to exist by the 121 jury. 122 (b) If the defendant waived his or her right to a 123 sentencing proceeding by a jury, the court, after considering 124 all aggravating factors and mitigating circumstances, may impose a sentence of life imprisonment without the possibility of 125

Page 5 of 10

parole or a sentence of death. The court may impose a sentence of death only if the court finds that at least one aggravating factor has been proven to exist beyond a reasonable doubt.

Section 2. Subsections (2), (3), and (4) of section 921.142, Florida Statutes, are amended to read:

126

127

128

129

130

131

132

133

134

135

136137

138139

140

141

142

143

144

145

146

147

148

149

150

921.142 Sentence of death or life imprisonment for capital drug trafficking felonies; further proceedings to determine sentence.—

(2) SEPARATE PROCEEDINGS ON ISSUE OF PENALTY. - Upon conviction or adjudication of guilt of a defendant of a capital felony under s. 893.135, the court shall conduct a separate sentencing proceeding to determine whether the defendant should be sentenced to death or life imprisonment as authorized by s. 775.082. The proceeding shall be conducted by the trial judge before the trial jury as soon as practicable, if the defendant has not waived his or her right to a sentencing recommendation by a jury. If, through impossibility or inability, the trial jury is unable to reconvene for a hearing on the issue of penalty, having determined the guilt of the accused, the trial judge may summon a special juror or jurors as provided in chapter 913 to make a recommendation as to determine the issue of the imposition of the penalty. If the trial jury has been waived, or if the defendant pleaded guilty, the sentencing proceeding shall be conducted before a jury impaneled for that purpose, unless waived by the defendant. In the proceeding,

Page 6 of 10

evidence may be presented as to any matter that the court deems relevant to the nature of the crime and the character of the defendant and shall include matters relating to any of the aggravating factors enumerated in subsection (7) and for which notice has been provided pursuant to s. 782.04(1)(b) or mitigating circumstances enumerated in subsection (8). Any such evidence that the court deems to have probative value may be received, regardless of its admissibility under the exclusionary rules of evidence, provided the defendant is accorded a fair opportunity to rebut any hearsay statements. However, this subsection shall not be construed to authorize the introduction of any evidence secured in violation of the Constitution of the United States or the Constitution of the State of Florida. The state and the defendant or the defendant's counsel shall be permitted to present argument for or against sentence of death.

- (3) FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDED SENTENCE BY THE JURY. -
- (a) This subsection applies only if the defendant has not waived his or her right to a sentencing <u>recommendation</u> proceeding by a jury.
- (b) After hearing all the evidence, the jury shall deliberate and render an advisory sentence to the court, based upon the following matters:
- 1. Whether sufficient aggravating factors exist as enumerated in subsection (7). A finding that an aggravating factor exists must be unanimous.

Page 7 of 10

2. Whether sufficient mitigating circumstances exist which outweigh the aggravating factors found to exist.

3. Based on these considerations, whether the defendant should be sentenced to life imprisonment or death.

- (c) If at least eight jurors determine that the defendant should be sentenced to death, the jury's recommendation to the court shall be a sentence of death. If fewer than eight jurors determine that the defendant should be sentenced to death, the jury's recommendation to the court shall be a sentence of life imprisonment without the possibility of parole.
- (4) FINDINGS IN SUPPORT OF SENTENCE OF DEATH.—
 Notwithstanding the recommendation of the jury, the court, after weighing the aggravating and mitigating circumstances, shall enter a sentence of life imprisonment or death, but if the court imposes a sentence of death, it shall set forth in writing its findings upon which the sentence of death is based as to the facts:
- (a) That sufficient aggravating factors exist as enumerated in subsection (7).
- (b) That there are insufficient mitigating circumstances to outweigh the aggravating factors.
- (a) After hearing all of the evidence presented regarding aggravating factors and mitigating circumstances, the jury shall deliberate and determine if the state has proven, beyond a reasonable doubt, the existence of at least one aggravating

Page 8 of 10

201 factor set forth in subsection (7). 202 (b) The jury shall return findings identifying each 203 aggravating factor found to exist. A finding that an aggravating 204 factor exists must be unanimous. If the jury: 205 1. Does not unanimously find at least one aggravating 206 factor, the defendant is incligible for a sentence of death. 207 2. Unanimously finds at least one aggravating factor, the 208 defendant is eligible for a sentence of death and the jury shall 209 make a recommendation to the court as to whether the defendant 210 shall be sentenced to life imprisonment without the possibility 211 of parole or to death. The recommendation shall be based on a 212 weighing of all of the following: 213 a. Whether sufficient aggravating factors exist. 214 b. Whether aggravating factors exist which outweigh the 215 mitigating circumstances found to exist. 216 c. Based on the considerations in sub-subparagraphs a. and 217 b., whether the defendant should be sentenced to life 218 imprisonment without the possibility of parole or to death. 219 a unanimous jury determines that the defendant 220 should be sentenced to death, the jury's recommendation to the 221 court shall be a sentence of death. If a unanimous jury does not 222 determine that the defendant should be sentenced to death, the 223 jury's recommendation to the court shall be a sentence of life 224 imprisonment without the possibility of parole. 225 (4) IMPOSITION OF SENTENCE OF LIFE IMPRISONMENT OR DEATH. -

Page 9 of 10

226	(a) If the jury has recommended a sentence of:
227	1. Life imprisonment without the possibility of parole,
228	the court shall impose the recommended sentence.
229	2. Death, the court, after considering each aggravating
230	factor found by the jury and all mitigating circumstances, may
231	impose a sentence of life imprisonment without the possibility
232	of parole or a sentence of death. The court may consider only an
233	aggravating factor that was unanimously found to exist by the
234	jury.
235	(b) If the defendant waived his or her right to a
236	sentencing proceeding by a jury, the court, after considering
237	all aggravating factors and mitigating circumstances, may impose
238	a sentence of life imprisonment without the possibility of
239	parole or a sentence of death. The court may impose a sentence
240	of death only if the court finds at least one aggravating factor
241	has been proven to exist beyond a reasonable doubt.
12	Section 3 This act shall take effect July 1 2023