2

3

4

5

7

8

9

1011

12

13

1415

16

1718

19 20

21

22

2324

2526

27

28

29

30

31

By Representatives Crist, Ball, Trovillion, Futch, Bainter, Lynn, Crow, Thrasher, Starks, Livingston, Putnam, Wallace, Melvin, Casey, Wise, Posey, Constantine, King, Littlefield, Brooks, Jones, Albright, Tamargo, Carlton, (Additional Sponsors on Last Printed Page)

A bill to be entitled An act relating to state postconviction proceedings; creating the "Death Penalty Appeals Reform Act of 1998"; amending s. 27.7001, F.S.; revising legislative intent with respect to collateral representation to exclude postconviction proceedings in state court; amending s. 27.701, F.S.; making the regions of the capital collateral regional counsel offices coincident with the jurisdictional areas of certain federal court districts; amending s. 27.702, F.S., relating to duties of capital collateral regional counsel; eliminating certain duties for representation in state court proceedings; revising time limitation for application for relief in federal court; prohibiting use of state funds by the capital collateral regional counsel offices for purposes of state court litigation; amending s. 27.704, F.S.; providing for contracts with private counsel for representation in federal postconviction proceedings; amending s. 27.707, F.S.; providing for service of process of certain subpoenas or court orders issued by federal courts or federal judges; amending s. 12, ch. 97-313, Laws of Florida, to eliminate legislative recommendation that the Florida Supreme Court adopt by rule specified provisions limiting the time for postconviction proceedings in capital cases; amending s. 27.708, F.S., relating to access to prisoners

1 and compliance with Florida Rules of Criminal 2 Procedure; removing certain provisions with 3 respect to compliance with Florida Rules of Criminal Procedure; amending s. 79.01, F.S., 4 5 relating to application and writ for habeas corpus; providing that a judgment of conviction 6 7 or sentence which has been affirmed on direct appeal constitutes "lawful authority" to detain 8 9 a person for purposes of construing specified 10 provisions; amending s. 924.051, F.S.; revising provisions relating to terms and conditions of 11 appeals and collateral review in criminal 12 13 cases, to provide for elimination of certain 14 postconviction proceedings in state courts; 15 providing that a state court may not review or examine the legality of judgment or sentence 16 17 imposed in a criminal case by a court of 18 competent jurisdiction, except pursuant to 19 direct appeal; amending s. 924.055, F.S.; 20 prohibiting certain postconviction proceedings 21 in state courts; repealing s. 924.066, F.S., 22 relating to collateral relief; creating s. 23 925.0365, F.S.; providing that the admission of ineffective assistance of counsel by attorney 24 25 in a criminal proceeding makes the attorney ineligible for certain public employment or 26 27 state compensation in criminal matters; 28 providing for mandatory notification by the 29 Attorney General to The Florida Bar and 30 specified other entities of such admission; repealing Rules 3.850, 3.851, and 3.852,

Florida Rules of Criminal Procedure, relating to motion to vacate, set aside, or correct sentence, collateral relief after death sentence has been imposed, and capital postconviction public records production, respectively; providing an effective date.

WHEREAS, convicted murderers sentenced to death are allowed to file multiple appeals of their convictions and sentences and to reargue factual and legal rulings, causing years of delay in death penalty cases in state courts, and

WHEREAS, the federal courts also review the conviction and sentence of every convicted murderer sentenced to death in this state, wherein the convicted murderer again challenges factual and legal rulings of the state courts of this state, and

WHEREAS, in cases such as Thompson v. Keohane, 64 U.S.L.W. 4027 (Nov. 29, 1995), the United States Supreme Court has allowed state prisoners to relitigate state courts' factual and legal rulings in the federal courts, and

WHEREAS, convicted murderers sentenced to death often return to the state courts to file further appeals after previously receiving extensive judicial review in state and federal courts, and

WHEREAS, this duplicative system of judicial review of state court judgments and sentences in criminal cases causes unjustifiable delays in death penalty cases, causing further suffering to victims and fostering disrespect of the courts and the rule of law in this state, and

WHEREAS, the state courts have granted criminal defendants in this state more rights than ever before in

history, including extensive pretrial discovery in which defendants are entitled to examine all evidence long before trial, and

WHEREAS, Florida provides free legal representation to criminal defendants, including free postconviction legal representation, to exercise these legal rights before trial, during trial, on direct appeal in state courts, on appeal to the United States Supreme Court, and on postconviction review in lower federal courts, and

WHEREAS, the Board of Executive Clemency has the power to pardon or commute any criminal sentence should the board find sufficient grounds to justify granting such relief, and

WHEREAS, the Federal Constitution does not require this state to allow repetitive appeals of criminal judgments and sentences, and

WHEREAS, the elimination of state court postconviction review of criminal judgments and sentences that have previously been upheld on direct appeal will further justice, finality, and the rule of law, NOW, THEREFORE,

Be It Enacted by the Legislature of the State of Florida:

Section 1. This act shall be known and may be cited as the "Death Penalty Appeals Reform Act of 1998."

Section 2. Section 27.7001, Florida Statutes, 1996 Supplement, is amended to read:

27.7001 Legislative intent.—It is the intent of the Legislature to create part IV of this chapter, consisting of ss. 27.7001–27.708, inclusive, to provide for the collateral representation of any person convicted and sentenced to death in this state, so that collateral legal proceedings to

4

6 7

8

10

11 12

13

14 15

16

17 18

19

20

21

22

23

2425

26

27

28

2930

challenge any Florida capital conviction and sentence may be commenced in a timely manner and so as to assure the people of this state that the judgments of its courts may be regarded with the finality to which they are entitled in the interests of justice. It is the further intent of the Legislature that collateral representation shall not include representation during retrials, resentencings, proceedings commenced under chapter 940, or civil litigation, or any postconviction proceedings in state court.

Section 3. Section 27.701, Florida Statutes, as amended by chapter 97-313, Laws of Florida, is amended to read:

27.701 Capital collateral regional counsels.--There are created three regional offices of capital collateral counsel, which shall be located in a northern, middle, and southern region of the state. The northern region shall consist of the area under the jurisdiction of the United States District Court, Northern District of Florida First, Second, Third, Fourth, Eighth, and Fourteenth Judicial Circuits; the middle region shall consist of the area under the jurisdiction of the United States District Court, Middle District of Florida Fifth, Sixth, Seventh, Ninth, Tenth, Twelfth, Thirteenth, and Eighteenth Judicial Circuits; and the southern region shall consist of the area under the jurisdiction of the United States District Court, Southern District of Florida Eleventh, Fifteenth, Sixteenth, Seventeenth, Nineteenth, and Twentieth Judicial Circuits. Each regional office shall be administered by a regional counsel. A regional counsel must be, and must have been for the preceding 5 years, a member in good standing of The Florida Bar or a similar organization in another state. Each capital collateral

4 5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13 14

15

16 17

18

19

20 21

22

23

24 25

26

27

28

29

30

regional counsel shall be appointed by the Governor, and is subject to confirmation by the Senate. The Supreme Court Judicial Nominating Commission shall recommend to the Governor three qualified candidates for each appointment as regional counsel. The Governor shall appoint a regional counsel for each region from among the recommendations, or, if it is in the best interest of the fair administration of justice in capital cases, the Governor may reject the nominations and request submission of three new nominees by the Supreme Court Judicial Nominating Commission. Each capital collateral regional counsel shall be appointed to a term of 3 years. Vacancies in the office of capital collateral regional counsel shall be filled in the same manner as appointments. A person appointed as a regional counsel may not run for or accept appointment to any state office for 2 years following vacation of office.

Section 4. Section 27.702, Florida Statutes, as amended by chapter 97-313, Laws of Florida, is amended to read:

27.702 Duties of the capital collateral regional counsel; reports.--

(1) The capital collateral regional counsel shall represent each person convicted and sentenced to death by a court of in this state for the sole purpose of instituting and prosecuting collateral actions challenging the legality of the judgment and sentence imposed against such person in the state courts, federal courts in this state, the United States Court of Appeals for the Eleventh Circuit, and the United States Supreme Court. Representation by the regional counsel shall commence automatically upon termination of direct appellate 31 proceedings in state or federal courts. Within 180 91 days

after the date the Supreme Court issues a mandate on a direct appeal or the United States Supreme Court denies a petition 3 for certiorari, whichever is later, the capital collateral 4 regional counsel shall file a notice of appearance in the 5 trial court in which the judgment and sentence were entered 6 and shall secure all direct-appeal files for collateral 7 representation and file a petition or motion for any appropriate relief in federal court, unless the capital 8 9 collateral regional counsel determines there are no grounds 10 for federal relief. The capital collateral regional counsel shall comply with all applicable federal laws and rules. 11 Upon receipt of files from the public defender or other counsel, 12 13 the capital collateral regional counsel shall assign each such case to personnel in his or her office for investigation, 14 15 client contact, and any further action the circumstances warrant. The three capital collateral regional counsels' 16 offices shall function independently and be separate budget 17 18 entities, and the regional counsels shall be the office heads 19 for all purposes. The Justice Administrative Commission shall 20 provide administrative support and service to the three 21 offices to the extent requested by the regional counsels. The 22 three regional offices shall not be subject to control, 23 supervision, or direction by the Justice Administrative Commission in any manner, including, but not limited to, 24 25 personnel, purchasing, transactions involving real or personal 26 property, and budgetary matters.

(2) The capital collateral regional counsel shall

represent each person convicted and sentenced to death by a

grounds to seek appropriate federal relief, in federal court collateral postconviction proceedings only, unless a court

court of this state within the counsel's region, who has

27

28

29

30

appoints or permits other counsel to appear as counsel of record.

- (3)(a) The capital collateral regional counsel shall file motions seeking compensation for representation and reimbursement for expenses pursuant to 18 U.S.C. s. 3006A when providing representation to indigent persons in the federal courts, and shall deposit all such payments received into the Capital Collateral Trust Fund established for such purpose.
- (b) The court having jurisdiction over any nonindigent or indigent-but-able-to-contribute defendant who has been receiving the services of the capital collateral regional counsel may assess attorney's fees and costs against the defendant at any stage in the proceedings as the court may deem appropriate. The determination of indigency or nonindigency of any defendant shall be made by the court pursuant to s. 27.52. Liability for the costs of such representation may be imposed in the form of a lien against the property of the nonindigent or indigent-but-able-to-contribute defendant, which lien shall be enforceable as provided in s. 27.56 or s. 27.561.
- (4) Each capital collateral regional counsel shall provide a quarterly report to the President of the Senate, the Speaker of the House of Representatives, and the Commission on the Administration of Justice in Capital Cases which details the number of hours worked by investigators and legal counsel per case and the amounts per case expended during the preceding quarter in investigating and litigating capital collateral cases.
- (5) Unless otherwise authorized by the Legislature, the capital collateral regional counsel offices and their personnel are prohibited from using, expending, or otherwise

committing any state funds for purposes of litigating cases in the courts of this state, or from entering into any agreement or contract which would result directly or indirectly in the ultimate use, expenditure, or commitment of any state funds for such purposes.

Section 5. Section 27.704, Florida Statutes, as amended by chapter 97-313, Laws of Florida, is amended to read:

- 27.704 Appointment of assistants and other staff; method of payments.--Each capital collateral regional counsel may:
- (1) Appoint, employ, and establish, in such numbers as he or she determines, full-time or part-time assistant counsel, investigators, and other clerical and support personnel who shall be paid from funds appropriated for that purpose. A full-time assistant capital collateral counsel must be a member in good standing of The Florida Bar, with not less than 3 years' experience in the practice of criminal law, and, prior to employment, must have participated in at least five felony jury trials, five felony appeals, or five capital postconviction evidentiary hearings or any combination of at least five of such proceedings. Law school graduates who do not have the qualifications of a full-time assistant capital collateral counsel may be employed as members of the legal staff but may not be designated as sole counsel for any person.
- (2) Contract with private counsel who are members in good standing of The Florida Bar or with public defenders for the purpose of providing prompt and cost-effective representation for individuals who are sentenced to death in this state in federal postconviction proceedings. A private

counsel or public defender under contract with the regional counsel must have at least 3 years' experience in the practice of criminal law, and, prior to the contract, must have participated in at least five felony jury trials, five felony appeals, or five capital postconviction evidentiary hearings or any combination of at least five of such proceedings.

(3) Appoint pro bono assistant counsel, who must be members in good standing of The Florida Bar, and who shall serve without compensation at the discretion of the capital collateral regional counsel.

Section 6. Section 27.707, Florida Statutes, as amended by chapter 97-313, Laws of Florida, is amended to read:

27.707 Investigators; service of process.--Each investigator employed by the capital collateral regional counsel has full authority to serve any subpoena or court order issued by any <u>federal</u> court or <u>federal</u> judge in any case for which the office has responsibility for providing representation.

Section 7. Section 12 of chapter 97-313, Laws of Florida, is amended to read:

Section 12. In the interest of promoting justice and integrity with respect to capital collateral representation, the Legislature recommends that the Supreme Court÷

(1) Adopt by rule the provisions of section 924.055, Florida Statutes, which limit the time for postconviction proceedings in capital cases.

(2) award pro bono service credit for time spent by an attorney in providing legal representation to an individual sentenced to death in this state, regardless of whether the attorney receives compensation for such representation.

Section 8. Section 27.708, Florida Statutes, as amended by chapter 97-313, Laws of Florida, is amended to read:

- 27.708 Access to prisoners; compliance with the Florida Rules of Criminal Procedure in capital collateral litigation; records requests; approval of records requests.--
- (1) Each capital collateral regional counsel and his or her assistants may inquire of all persons sentenced to death who are incarcerated and tender them advice and counsel at any reasonable time, but this section does not apply with respect to persons who are represented by other counsel.
- (2) The capital collateral regional counsel and contracted private counsel must timely comply with all provisions of the Florida Rules of Criminal Procedure governing collateral review of capital cases, including provisions pertaining to requests for records under Florida Rule of Criminal Procedure 3.852.
- (3) All requests for records in capital postconviction proceedings must be made in accordance with Florida Rule of Criminal Procedure 3.852, and, if the person sentenced to death is represented by an assistant capital collateral regional counsel or other attorney appointed to assist the regional counsel, the regional counsel must approve the request.
- Section 9. Section 79.01, Florida Statutes, is amended to read:
 - 79.01 Application and writ.--
- (1) When any person detained in custody, whether charged with a criminal offense or not, applies to the Supreme Court or any justice thereof, or to any district court of appeal or any judge thereof or to any circuit judge for a writ

of habeas corpus and shows by affidavit or evidence probable cause to believe that he or she is detained without lawful authority, the court, justice, or judge to whom such application is made shall grant the writ forthwith, against the person in whose custody the applicant is detained and returnable immediately before any of the courts, justices, or judges as the writ directs.

(2) For purposes of construing this section, a judgment of conviction or sentence which has been affirmed on direct appeal constitutes "lawful authority."

Section 10. Subsection (6) of section 924.051, Florida Statutes, as amended by chapters 97-102 and 97-313, Laws of Florida, is repealed, and subsections (2), (5), (7), (8), and (9) of said section are amended to read:

924.051 Terms and conditions of appeals and collateral review in criminal cases.--

- (1) As used in this section:
- (a) "Prejudicial error" means an error in the trial court that harmfully affected the judgment or sentence.
- (b) "Preserved" means that an issue, legal argument, or objection to evidence was timely raised before, and ruled on by, the trial court, and that the issue, legal argument, or objection to evidence was sufficiently precise that it fairly apprised the trial court of the relief sought and the grounds therefor.
- (2) The right to direct appeal and the provisions for collateral review created in this chapter may only be implemented in strict accordance with the terms and conditions of this section.
- (3) An appeal may not be taken from a judgment or order of a trial court unless a prejudicial error is alleged

and is properly preserved or, if not properly preserved, would constitute fundamental error. A judgment or sentence may be reversed on appeal only when an appellate court determines after a review of the complete record that prejudicial error occurred and was properly preserved in the trial court or, if not properly preserved, would constitute fundamental error.

- (4) If a defendant pleads no lo contendere without expressly reserving the right to appeal a legally dispositive issue, or if a defendant pleads guilty without expressly reserving the right to appeal a legally dispositive issue, the defendant may not appeal the judgment or sentence.
- on grounds that were or could have been raised at trial and, if properly preserved, on direct appeal of the conviction and sentence. A state court shall not review or examine the legality of a judgment or sentence imposed in a criminal case by a court of competent jurisdiction, except pursuant to a direct appeal of the judgment or sentence to the court having appellate jurisdiction over that criminal case.
- (6) A petition or motion for collateral or other postconviction relief may not be considered if it is filed more than 2 years after the judgment and sentence became final in a noncapital case or more than 1 year after the judgment and sentence became final in a capital case in which a death sentence was imposed unless it alleges that:
- (a) The facts upon which the claim is predicated were unknown to the petitioner or his attorney and could not have been ascertained by the exercise of due diligence;
- (b) The fundamental constitutional right asserted was not established within the period provided for in this subsection and has been held to apply retroactively; or

5

7 8 10

6

11 12

13

14 15 16

17 18 19

20 21 22

23 24

25

26 27

28 29

30

(c) The sentence imposed was illegal because it either exceeded the maximum or fell below the minimum authorized by statute for the criminal offense at issue. Either the state or the defendant may petition the trial court to vacate an illegal sentence at any time.

(6)(7) In a direct appeal or a collateral proceeding, the party challenging the judgment or order of the trial court has the burden of demonstrating that a prejudicial error occurred in the trial court. A conviction or sentence may not be reversed absent an express finding that a prejudicial error occurred in the trial court.

(7) (8) It is the intent of the Legislature that all terms and conditions of direct appeal and collateral review be strictly enforced, including the application of procedural bars, to ensure that all claims of error are raised and resolved at the first opportunity. It is also the Legislature's intent that all procedural bars to direct appeal and collateral review be fully enforced by the courts of this state.

(8)(9) Funds, resources, or employees of this state or its political subdivisions may not be used, directly or indirectly, in appellate or collateral proceedings unless the use is constitutionally or statutorily mandated.

Section 11. Section 924.055, Florida Statutes, 1996 Supplement, is amended to read:

924.055 Time limitations for Postconviction proceedings in capital cases prohibited in state courts. --

(1) The Legislature recognizes that unjustified delay in postconviction proceedings in capital cases frustrates justice and diminishes public confidence in the criminal justice system. A state court shall not review or examine the

4 5

6 7

8 9

10

11

12 13

14 15

16 17

18 19

20 21

22

23

24

25

26 27

28

29

30

legality of a judgment or sentence imposed in a criminal case by a court of competent jurisdiction, except pursuant to a direct appeal of the judgment or sentence to the court having appellant jurisdiction over that criminal case. It is the intent of the Legislature that postconviction proceedings in capital cases progress in a fair but timely fashion and that, absent extreme circumstances, the participants in such proceedings abide by the time limitations set forth in this section.

- (2) Within 1 year after the date the Supreme Court issues a mandate on a direct appeal or the United States Supreme Court denies a petition for certiorari, whichever is later, all postconviction motions and petitions that challenge the judgment, sentence, or appellate decision must be filed in the appropriate court.
- (3) Within 90 days after the date the state files a response to a postconviction motion that challenges the judgment or sentence, the circuit court shall conduct all necessary hearings and render a decision.
- (4) Within 200 days after the date a notice is filed appealing an order of the trial court or an extraordinary writ is filed in a postconviction proceeding, the Supreme Court shall render a decision.
- (5) A convicted person must file any petition for habeas corpus in the district court of the United States within 90 days after the date the Supreme Court issues a mandate in a postconviction proceeding.
- Section 12. Section 924.066, Florida Statutes, 1996 Supplement, is repealed.
- Section 13. Section 925.0365, Florida Statutes, is 31 created to read:

2.8

925.0365 Admission of ineffective assistance of counsel by attorney in criminal proceeding to preclude attorney from public employment or compensation in criminal matters; mandatory notification to The Florida Bar of admission.--

- (1) An attorney who admits to a court to have provided ineffective assistance of counsel in a criminal matter shall be ineligible for public employment under chapters 16 and 27 and shall be ineligible to be paid state funds as compensation for representation in any future criminal proceedings initiated after the date the attorney admitted to having provided ineffective assistance of counsel.
- (2) When an attorney admits to a court in a postconviction proceeding that he or she provided ineffective assistance of counsel in a criminal matter, then the Attorney General shall immediately notify The Florida Bar of such admission of ineffective assistance of counsel for disciplinary proceedings in accordance with rules promulgated by the Florida Supreme Court. The Attorney General shall also provide notification of the attorney's admission of ineffective assistance of counsel to the Comptroller, the Commission on the Administration of Justice in Capital Cases, the Florida Supreme Court, and the Justice Administrative Commission.

Rules of Criminal Procedure, relating to motions to vacate, set aside, or correct sentence, collateral relief after death sentence has been imposed, and capital postconviction public records production, respectively, are hereby repealed.

Section 15. This act shall take effect July 1 of the year in which enacted, except that section 14 shall take

effect only if this act is passed by the affirmative vote of two-thirds of the membership of each house of the Legislature. HOUSE SUMMARY Creates the "Death Penalty Appeals Reform Act of 1998." Provides that collateral representation shall not include representation during postconviction proceedings in state court. Makes the areas of the capital collateral regions coincident with the jurisdictional areas of certain federal court districts. Revises duties of capital collateral regional counsel to eliminate certain representation in state court proceedings. Prohibits use of state funds by the capital collateral regional counsel offices for purposes of any litigation in state court. Revises time limitation relating to application for Revises time limitation relating to application for relief in federal court. Removes certain provisions with respect to compliance with Florida Rules of Criminal Procedure. Provides that a judgment of conviction or sentence which has been affirmed on direct appeal constitutes "lawful authority" to detain a person for purposes of construing specified provisions. Prohibits postconviction proceedings in state court. Provides certain sanctions for attorneys who admit to providing ineffective assistance of counsel. Repeals Rules 3.850, 3.851, and 3.852, Florida Rules of Criminal Procedure, relating to motion to vacate, set aside, or correct sentence, collateral relief after death sentence has been imposed, and capital postconviction public records imposed, and capital postconviction public records production, respectively. See bill for details. ADDITIONAL SPONSORS Edwards, Turnbull, Boyd, Bronson, Saunders, Maygarden, Valdes, Fasano, Smith, Minton, Morroni, Fischer, Bitner, Arnall, Safley, Feeney, K. Pruitt, Culp, Goode, Peaden, Spratt, Kelly, Byrd, Burroughs, Flanagan, Stabins, Sindler, Cosgrove, D. Prewitt, Heyman, Merchant, Fuller, Crady, Dockery, Argenziano, Mackey, Brown, Hafner, Stafford, Bloom, Wiles, Sembler, Mackenzie, Jacobs, Harrington, Villalobos and Westbrook