Florida House of Representatives - 1999 HB 2185

By the Committee on Judiciary and Representatives Byrd, Levine and Sobel

A bill to be entitled 1 2 An act relating to medical negligence actions; 3 amending s. 766.102, F.S.; providing requirements for expert witness testimony in 4 5 actions based on medical negligence; providing a definition; amending s. 766.106, F.S.; 6 7 providing requirements with respect to notice 8 before filing action for medical malpractice; 9 regulating unsworn statements of treating physicians; amending s. 766.207, F.S.; revising 10 11 language with respect to voluntary binding 12 arbitration of medical malpractice claims; 13 providing for the effect of an offer to submit to voluntary binding arbitration with respect 14 to allegations contained in the claimant's 15 16 notice of intent letter; amending s. 455.667, 17 F.S.; permitting unsworn statements of treating physicians without written authorization; 18 providing effective dates. 19 20 21 Be It Enacted by the Legislature of the State of Florida: 22 Section 1. Section 766.102, Florida Statutes, 1998 23 Supplement, is amended to read: 24 25 766.102 Medical negligence; standards of recovery .--26 (1) In any action for recovery of damages based on the 27 death or personal injury of any person in which it is alleged 28 that such death or injury resulted from the negligence of a 29 health care provider as defined in s. 768.50(2)(b), the claimant shall have the burden of proving by the greater 30 31 weight of evidence that the alleged actions of the health care 1

provider represented a breach of the prevailing professional 1 2 standard of care for that health care provider. The prevailing professional standard of care for a given health 3 care provider shall be that level of care, skill, and 4 5 treatment which, in light of all relevant surrounding б circumstances, is recognized as acceptable and appropriate by 7 reasonably prudent similar health care providers. 8 (2) A person may not give expert testimony concerning the prevailing professional standard of care unless that 9 person is a licensed health care provider and meets the 10 11 following criteria: 12 (a) If the party against whom or on whose behalf the 13 testimony is offered is a specialist, the expert witness must: 14 1. Specialize in the same specialty as the party 15 against whom or on whose behalf the testimony is offered; or 16 2. Specialize in a similar specialty that includes the evaluation, diagnosis, or treatment of the medical condition 17 that is the subject of the complaint and have prior experience 18 19 treating similar patients. 20 (b) During the 3 years immediately preceding the date of the occurrence that is the basis for the action, the expert 21 22 witness must have devoted professional time to: 23 1. The active clinical practice or consulting of the 24 same or similar health profession as the health care provider 25 against whom or on whose behalf the testimony is offered and, 26 if that health care provider is a specialist, the active clinical practice or consulting of the same specialty or a 27 28 similar specialty that includes the evaluation, diagnosis, or 29 treatment of the medical condition or procedure that is the

30 subject of the action and have prior experience treating

31 similar patients;

The instruction of students in an accredited health 1 2. 2 professional school or accredited residency program in the 3 same or similar health profession as the health care provider against whom or on whose behalf the testimony is offered, and 4 5 if that health care provider is a specialist, an accredited 6 health professional school or accredited residency or clinical 7 research program in the same or similar specialty; or 8 3. A clinical research program that is affiliated with 9 an accredited medical school or teaching hospital and that is in the same or similar health profession as the health care 10 11 provider against whom or on whose behalf the testimony is 12 offered and, if that health care provider is a specialist, a 13 clinical research program that is affiliated with an 14 accredited health professional school or accredited residency or clinical research program in the same or similar specialty. 15 16 (3) Notwithstanding subsection (2), if the health care provider against whom or on whose behalf the testimony is 17 offered is a general practitioner, the expert witness, during 18 19 the 3 years immediately preceding the date of the occurrence 20 that is the basis for the action, must have devoted his or her 21 professional time to: 22 (a) Active clinical practice or consulting as a general practitioner; 23 (b) Instruction of students in an accredited health 24 25 professional school or accredited residency program in the 26 general practice of medicine; or 27 (c) A clinical research program that is affiliated 28 with an accredited medical school or teaching hospital and 29 that is in the general practice of medicine. (4) Notwithstanding subsection (2), a physician 30 licensed under chapter 458 or chapter 459 who qualifies as an 31 3

expert under the section and who by reason of active clinical 1 practice or instruction of students has knowledge of the 2 applicable standard of care for nurses, nurse practitioners, 3 certified registered nurse anesthetists, certified registered 4 5 nurse midwives, physician assistants, or other medical support 6 staff may give expert testimony in a medical negligence action 7 with respect to the standard of care of such medical support 8 staff. 9 (5) In an action alleging medical negligence, an expert witness may not testify on a contingency fee basis. 10 11 (6) This section does not limit the power of the trial 12 court to disqualify or qualify an expert witness on grounds 13 other than the qualification in this section. 14 (7) Notwithstanding subsection (2), in a medical 15 negligence action against a hospital or other health care or 16 medical facility, a person may give expert testimony on the appropriate standard of care as to administrative and other 17 nonclinical issues if the person has substantial knowledge, by 18 19 virtue of his or her training and experience, concerning the 20 standard of care among hospitals, or health care or medical facilities of the same type as the hospital, health facility, 21 22 or medical facility whose actions or inactions are the subject of this testimony and which are located in the same or similar 23 24 communities at the time of the alleged act giving rise to the 25 cause of action. 26 (2)(a) If the health care provider whose negligence is 27 claimed to have created the cause of action is not certified 28 by the appropriate American board as being a specialist, is 29 not trained and experienced in a medical specialty, or does 30 not hold himself or herself out as a specialist, a "similar health care provider" is one who: 31

4

HB 2185

1 1. Is licensed by the appropriate regulatory agency of 2 this state; 3 2. Is trained and experienced in the same discipline or school of practice; and 4 5 3. Practices in the same or similar medical community. 6 (b) If the health care provider whose negligence is 7 claimed to have created the cause of action is certified by 8 the appropriate American board as a specialist, is trained and experienced in a medical specialty, or holds himself or 9 herself out as a specialist, a "similar health care provider" 10 11 is one who: 12 1. Is trained and experienced in the same specialty; 13 and 14 2. Is certified by the appropriate American board in 15 the same specialty. 16 However, if any health care provider described in this 17 paragraph is providing treatment or diagnosis for a condition 18 which is not within his or her specialty, a specialist trained 19 20 in the treatment or diagnosis for that condition shall be considered a "similar health care provider." 21 (c) The purpose of this subsection is to establish a 22 relative standard of care for various categories and 23 classifications of health care providers. Any health care 24 25 provider may testify as an expert in any action if he or she: 26 1. Is a similar health care provider pursuant to 27 paragraph (a) or paragraph (b); or 28 2. Is not a similar health care provider pursuant to paragraph (a) or paragraph (b) but, to the satisfaction of the 29 court, possesses sufficient training, experience, and 30 knowledge as a result of practice or teaching in the specialty 31 5

of the defendant or practice or teaching in a related field of medicine, so as to be able to provide such expert testimony as to the prevailing professional standard of care in a given field of medicine. Such training, experience, or knowledge must be as a result of the active involvement in the practice or teaching of medicine within the 5-year period before the incident giving rise to the claim.

8 (8)(3)(a) If the injury is claimed to have resulted from the negligent affirmative medical intervention of the 9 health care provider, the claimant must, in order to prove a 10 11 breach of the prevailing professional standard of care, show that the injury was not within the necessary or reasonably 12 13 foreseeable results of the surgical, medicinal, or diagnostic procedure constituting the medical intervention, if the 14 intervention from which the injury is alleged to have resulted 15 16 was carried out in accordance with the prevailing professional 17 standard of care by a reasonably prudent similar health care 18 provider.

(b) The provisions of this subsection shall apply only when the medical intervention was undertaken with the informed consent of the patient in compliance with the provisions of s. 766.103.

(9) (4) The existence of a medical injury shall not 23 create any inference or presumption of negligence against a 24 health care provider, and the claimant must maintain the 25 26 burden of proving that an injury was proximately caused by a breach of the prevailing professional standard of care by the 27 28 health care provider. However, the discovery of the presence of a foreign body, such as a sponge, clamp, forceps, surgical 29 needle, or other paraphernalia commonly used in surgical, 30 31 examination, or diagnostic procedures, shall be prima facie

1 evidence of negligence on the part of the health care
2 provider.

3 (10) (5) The Legislature is cognizant of the changing 4 trends and techniques for the delivery of health care in this 5 state and the discretion that is inherent in the diagnosis, б care, and treatment of patients by different health care 7 providers. The failure of a health care provider to order, 8 perform, or administer supplemental diagnostic tests shall not 9 be actionable if the health care provider acted in good faith 10 and with due regard for the prevailing professional standard 11 of care.

12 $(11)\frac{(6)}{(a)}$ In any action for damages involving a claim 13 of negligence against a physician licensed under chapter 458, 14 osteopathic physician licensed under chapter 459, podiatric physician licensed under chapter 461, or chiropractic 15 16 physician licensed under chapter 460 providing emergency medical services in a hospital emergency department, the court 17 shall admit expert medical testimony only from physicians, 18 19 osteopathic physicians, podiatric physicians, and chiropractic 20 physicians who have had substantial professional experience 21 within the preceding 5 years while assigned to provide 22 emergency medical services in a hospital emergency department. (b) For the purposes of this subsection: 23

The term "emergency medical services" means those
 medical services required for the immediate diagnosis and
 treatment of medical conditions which, if not immediately
 diagnosed and treated, could lead to serious physical or
 mental disability or death.

29 2. "Substantial professional experience" shall be 30 determined by the custom and practice of the manner in which 31 emergency medical coverage is provided in hospital emergency 7

departments in the same or similar localities where the 1 2 alleged negligence occurred. 3 (12) However, if any health care provider described in 4 subsection (2), subsection (3), or subsection (4) is providing 5 treatment or diagnosis for a condition which is not within his б or her specialty, a specialist trained in the treatment or 7 diagnosis for that condition shall be considered a "similar 8 health care provider." 9 Section 2. (1) Subsection (2) and paragraph (a) of subsection (7) of section 766.106, Florida Statutes, 1998 10 11 Supplement, are amended to read: 766.106 Notice before filing action for medical 12 13 malpractice; presuit screening period; offers for admission of 14 liability and for arbitration; informal discovery; review.--15 (2) After completion of presuit investigation pursuant 16 to s. 766.203 and prior to filing a claim for medical malpractice, a claimant shall notify each prospective 17 defendant and, if any prospective defendant is a health care 18 provider licensed under chapter 458, chapter 459, chapter 460, 19 20 chapter 461, or chapter 466, the Department of Health by 21 certified mail, return receipt requested, of intent to 22 initiate litigation for medical malpractice. Notice to each prospective defendant must include a list of all known health 23 24 care providers seen by the claimant subsequent to the alleged act of malpractice for the injuries complained of and those 25 26 known health care providers seen by the claimant for related 27 conditions during the 5-year period prior to the alleged act 28 of malpractice.Notice to the Department of Health must 29 include the full name and address of the claimant; the full names and any known addresses of any health care providers 30 31 licensed under chapter 458, chapter 459, chapter 460, chapter 8

1 461, or chapter 466 who are prospective defendants identified at the time; the date and a summary of the occurrence giving 2 3 rise to the claim; and a description of the injury to the claimant. The requirement for notice to the Department of 4 5 Health does not impair the claimant's legal rights or ability to seek relief for his or her claim, and the notice provided 6 7 to the department is not discoverable or admissible in any 8 civil or administrative action. The Department of Health shall review each incident and determine whether it involved conduct 9 by a licensee which is potentially subject to disciplinary 10 11 action, in which case the provisions of s. 455.621 apply. 12 (7) Informal discovery may be used by a party to 13 obtain unsworn statements, the production of documents or 14 things, and physical and mental examinations, as follows: 15 (a) Unsworn statements.--Any party may require other 16 parties and the claimant's treating physicians listed in the 17 claimant's notice to initiate litigation for medical malpractice to appear for the taking of an unsworn statement. 18 Such statements may be used only for the purpose of presuit 19 20 screening and are not discoverable or admissible in any civil 21 action for any purpose by any party. A party desiring to take 22 the unsworn statement of any party must give reasonable notice in writing to all parties. The notice must state the time and 23 place for taking the statement and the name and address of the 24 party to be examined. Unless otherwise impractical, the 25 26 examination of any party must be done at the same time by all 27 other parties. Any party may be represented by counsel at the 28 taking of an unsworn statement. An unsworn statement may be recorded electronically, stenographically, or on videotape. 29 The taking of unsworn statements is subject to the provisions 30 of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure and may be terminated 31

9

for abuses. Further, as to the taking of unsworn statements of 1 2 the claimant's treating physicians, the scope of such inquiry 3 shall be limited to opinions formulated by the treating physicians with respect to the issues of liability and damages 4 5 set forth in the claimant's notice of intent letter. In the 6 event that a prospective defendant did not take an unsworn 7 statement of a claimant's treating medical physicians as set 8 forth in the claimant's notice to initiate a claim for medical 9 malpractice, then an unsworn statement may be taken after suit has been filed, but no later than 90 days from the date of 10 11 service of the complaint on the defendant. However, in no 12 event shall a prospective defendant take more than one unsworn 13 statement of a treating physician. Unsworn statements taken 14 after suit has been filed are not admissible in the civil action for any purpose by any party. Nothing in this section 15 16 shall prohibit the taking of an unsworn statement of a 17 treating physician subsequent to the filing of the civil action upon good cause shown that the name of any treating 18 19 physician was not provided in the claimant's notice to 20 initiate a claim for medical malpractice. (2) This section shall apply to all notices of intent 21 22 to litigate sent on or after October 1, 1999. Section 3. (1) Effective upon this act becoming a 23 24 law, subsections (2) and (3) of section 766.207, Florida Statutes, are amended to read: 25 26 766.207 Voluntary binding arbitration of medical 27 negligence claims. --28 (2) Upon the completion of presuit investigation with 29 preliminary reasonable grounds for a medical negligence claim intact, the parties may elect to have damages determined by an 30 31 arbitration panel. Defendants offering to submit to 10

arbitration pursuant to this section and in conjunction with 1 2 s. 766.106 shall be deemed to have admitted both liability and causation with respect to the allegations contained in the 3 claimant's notice of intent letter.Such election may be 4 5 initiated by either party by serving a request for voluntary binding arbitration of damages within 90 days after receipt 6 7 service of the claimant's notice of intent to initiate 8 litigation upon the defendant. The evidentiary standards for voluntary binding arbitration of medical negligence claims 9 shall be as provided in ss. 120.569(2)(e) and 120.57(1)(c). 10 11 (3) Upon receipt of a party's request for such 12 arbitration, the opposing party may accept the offer of 13 voluntary binding arbitration within 30 days. However, in no event shall the defendant be required to respond to the 14 request for arbitration sooner than 90 days after service of 15 16 the notice of intent to initiate litigation under s. 766.106. Such acceptance within the time period provided by this 17 subsection shall be a binding commitment to comply with the 18 decision of the arbitration panel. The liability of any 19 20 insurer shall be subject to any applicable insurance policy 21 limits. A claimant's acceptance of an offer to arbitrate shall 22 not bar the claimant from pursuing a cause of action against defendants who do not offer or agree to arbitration under this 23 section. 24 The provisions of this section are remedial in 25 (2) 26 nature and shall apply to all civil actions pending on or 27 after the effective date of this section. 28 Section 4. (1) Paragraph (e) is added to subsection 29 (5) of section 455.667, Florida Statutes, 1998 Supplement, to 30 read: 31

11

455.667 Ownership and control of patient records; report or copies of records to be furnished .--(5) Except as otherwise provided in this section and in s. 440.13(4)(c), such records may not be furnished to, and the medical condition of a patient may not be discussed with, any person other than the patient or the patient's legal representative or other health care practitioners and providers involved in the care or treatment of the patient, except upon written authorization of the patient. However, such records may be furnished without written authorization under the following circumstances: (e) For purposes of taking an unsworn statement pursuant to s. 766.106(7)(a). (2) This section shall apply to all notices of intent to litigate sent on or after October 1, 1999. Section 5. Except as provided herein, this act shall take effect on October 1, 1999, and shall apply to causes of action accruing on or after said date. HOUSE SUMMARY Revises provisions of law relating to medical negligence actions to: 1. Provide requirements for expert witness testimony in actions based on medical negligence. 2. Provide requirements with respect to notice before filing an action for medical malpractice. 3. Regulate unsworn statements of treating physicians. 4. Revise language with respect to voluntary binding arbitration of medical malpractice claims. 5. Provide for the effect of an offer to submit to voluntary binding arbitration with respect to allegations contained in the claimant's notice of intent letter.

30 See bill for details.

31

1

2 3

4

5

6 7

8

9

10 11

12

13

14 15

16

17

18 19

20 21

22

23

24

25

26

27 28 29