Florida Senate - 2001

By Senator Burt

16-784B-01 A bill to be entitled 1 2 An act relating to expert witnesses in medical 3 negligence actions; amending s. 766.102, F.S.; 4 providing requirements for expert witness 5 testimony in actions based on medical negligence; amending s. 766.106, F.S.; 6 7 requiring claimants to provide a list of treating physicians; providing for presuit 8 9 unsworn statements of physicians; providing for unsworn statements after service of a complaint 10 upon a defendant physician; amending s. 11 12 455.667, F.S.; allowing unsworn statements for good cause shown; providing an effective date. 13 14 15 Be It Enacted by the Legislature of the State of Florida: 16 17 Section 1. Section 766.102, Florida Statutes, is amended to read: 18 19 766.102 Medical negligence; standards of recovery .--20 (1) In any action for recovery of damages based on the 21 death or personal injury of any person in which it is alleged 22 that such death or injury resulted from the negligence of a health care provider as defined in s. 768.50(2)(b), the 23 claimant shall have the burden of proving by the greater 24 25 weight of evidence that the alleged actions of the health care provider represented a breach of the prevailing professional 26 27 standard of care for that health care provider. The 28 prevailing professional standard of care for a given health care provider shall be that level of care, skill, and 29 30 treatment which, in light of all relevant surrounding 31

¹

1 circumstances, is recognized as acceptable and appropriate by 2 reasonably prudent similar health care providers. 3 (2) A person may not give expert testimony concerning the prevailing professional standard of care unless that 4 5 person is a licensed health care provider and meets the б following criteria: 7 If the party against whom or on whose behalf the (a) 8 testimony is offered is a specialist, the expert witness must: 9 Specialize in the same specialty as the party 1. 10 against whom or on whose behalf the testimony is offered; or 11 2. Specialize in a similar specialty that includes the evaluation, diagnosis, or treatment of the medical condition 12 that is the subject of the complaint and have prior experience 13 14 treating similar patients. (b) During the 3 years immediately preceding the date 15 of the occurrence that is the basis for the action, the expert 16 17 witness must have devoted professional time to: 18 The active clinical practice of, or consulting with 1. 19 respect to, the same or similar health profession as the health care provider against whom or on whose behalf the 20 21 testimony is offered and, if that health care provider is a specialist, the active clinical practice of, or consulting 22 with respect to, the same specialty or a similar specialty 23 that includes the evaluation, diagnosis, or treatment of the 24 medical condition that is the subject of the action and have 25 prior experience treating similar patients; 26 27 The instruction of students in an accredited health 2. professional school or accredited residency program in the 28 29 same or similar health profession in which the health care 30 provider against whom or on whose behalf the testimony is 31 offered, and if that health care provider is a specialist, an 2

1 accredited health professional school or accredited residency or clinical research program in the same or similar specialty; 2 3 or 3. A clinical research program that is affiliated with 4 5 an accredited medical school or teaching hospital and that is б in the same or similar health profession as the health care 7 provider against whom or on whose behalf the testimony is 8 offered and, if that health care provider is a specialist, a clinical research program that is affiliated with an 9 10 accredited health professional school or accredited residency 11 or clinical research program in the same or similar specialty. (3) Notwithstanding subsection (2), if the health care 12 provider against whom or on whose behalf the testimony is 13 offered is a general practitioner, the expert witness, during 14 the 3 years immediately preceding the date of the occurrence 15 that is the basis for the action, must have devoted his or her 16 17 professional time to: (a) Active clinical practice or consultation as a 18 19 general practitioner; 20 (b) Instruction of students in an accredited health 21 professional school or accredited residency program in the general practice of medicine; or 22 23 (c) A clinical research program that is affiliated 24 with an accredited medical school or teaching hospital and that is in the general practice of medicine. 25 (4) Notwithstanding subsection (2), a physician 26 27 licensed under chapter 458 or chapter 459 who qualifies as an expert under the section and who by reason of active clinical 28 29 practice or instruction of students has knowledge of the

- 30 applicable standard of care for nurses, nurse practitioners,
- 31 certified registered nurse anesthetists, certified registered

3

1 nurse midwives, physician assistants, or other medical support staff may give expert testimony in a medical malpractice 2 3 action with respect to the standard of care of such medical 4 support staff. 5 In an action alleging medical malpractice, an (5) б expert witness may not testify on a contingency fee basis. This section does not limit the power of the trial 7 (6) 8 court to disqualify or qualify an expert witness on grounds other than the qualifications in this section. 9 10 (7) Notwithstanding subsection (2), in a medical 11 malpractice action against a hospital or other health care or medical facility, a person may give expert testimony on the 12 appropriate standard of care as to administrative and other 13 nonclinical issues if the person has substantial knowledge, by 14 virtue of his or her training and experience, concerning the 15 standard of care among hospitals, or health care or medical 16 facilities of the same type as the hospital, health facility, 17 or medical facility whose actions or inactions are the subject 18 19 of this testimony and which are located in the same or similar communities at the time of the alleged act giving rise to the 20 21 cause of action. (2)(a) If the health care provider whose negligence is 22 claimed to have created the cause of action is not certified 23 24 by the appropriate American board as being a specialist, is 25 not trained and experienced in a medical specialty, or does not hold himself or herself out as a specialist, a "similar 26 27 health care provider" is one who: 28 1. Is licensed by the appropriate regulatory agency of 29 this state; 30 2. Is trained and experienced in the same discipline 31 or school of practice; and 4

1	3. Practices in the same or similar medical community.
2	(b) If the health care provider whose negligence is
3	claimed to have created the cause of action is certified by
4	the appropriate American board as a specialist, is trained and
5	experienced in a medical specialty, or holds himself or
6	herself out as a specialist, a "similar health care provider"
7	is one who:
, 8	
-	_
9	and
10	2. Is certified by the appropriate American board in
11	the same specialty.
12	
13	However, if any health care provider described in this
14	paragraph is providing treatment or diagnosis for a condition
15	which is not within his or her specialty, a specialist trained
16	in the treatment or diagnosis for that condition shall be
17	considered a "similar health care provider."
18	(c) The purpose of this subsection is to establish a
19	relative standard of care for various categories and
20	classifications of health care providers. Any health care
21	provider may testify as an expert in any action if he or she:
22	1. Is a similar health care provider pursuant to
23	paragraph (a) or paragraph (b); or
24	2. Is not a similar health care provider pursuant to
25	paragraph (a) or paragraph (b) but, to the satisfaction of the
26	court, possesses sufficient training, experience, and
27	knowledge as a result of practice or teaching in the specialty
28	of the defendant or practice or teaching in a related field of
29	medicine, so as to be able to provide such expert testimony as
30	to the prevailing professional standard of care in a given
31	field of medicine. Such training, experience, or knowledge
	5

1

2 3 must be as a result of the active involvement in the practice or teaching of medicine within the 5-year period before the incident giving rise to the claim.

(8)(3)(a) If the injury is claimed to have resulted 4 5 from the negligent affirmative medical intervention of the 6 health care provider, the claimant must, in order to prove a 7 breach of the prevailing professional standard of care, show that the injury was not within the necessary or reasonably 8 foreseeable results of the surgical, medicinal, or diagnostic 9 10 procedure constituting the medical intervention, if the 11 intervention from which the injury is alleged to have resulted was carried out in accordance with the prevailing professional 12 13 standard of care by a reasonably prudent similar health care provider. 14

(b) The provisions of this subsection shall apply only when the medical intervention was undertaken with the informed consent of the patient in compliance with the provisions of s. 766.103.

19 (9) (4) The existence of a medical injury shall not create any inference or presumption of negligence against a 20 health care provider, and the claimant must maintain the 21 burden of proving that an injury was proximately caused by a 22 breach of the prevailing professional standard of care by the 23 24 health care provider. However, the discovery of the presence 25 of a foreign body, such as a sponge, clamp, forceps, surgical needle, or other paraphernalia commonly used in surgical, 26 examination, or diagnostic procedures, shall be prima facie 27 28 evidence of negligence on the part of the health care 29 provider.

 $\frac{(10)(5)}{(5)}$ The Legislature is cognizant of the changing 31 trends and techniques for the delivery of health care in this

6

state and the discretion that is inherent in the diagnosis, care, and treatment of patients by different health care providers. The failure of a health care provider to order, perform, or administer supplemental diagnostic tests shall not be actionable if the health care provider acted in good faith and with due regard for the prevailing professional standard of care.

8 $(11)(a)\frac{(6)(a)}{(11)}$ In any action for damages involving a 9 claim of negligence against a physician licensed under chapter 10 458, osteopathic physician licensed under chapter 459, 11 podiatric physician licensed under chapter 461, or chiropractic physician licensed under chapter 460 providing 12 13 emergency medical services in a hospital emergency department, the court shall admit expert medical testimony only from 14 physicians, osteopathic physicians, podiatric physicians, and 15 chiropractic physicians who have had substantial professional 16 17 experience within the preceding 5 years while assigned to 18 provide emergency medical services in a hospital emergency 19 department.

20

(b) For the purposes of this subsection:

1. The term "emergency medical services" means those
medical services required for the immediate diagnosis and
treatment of medical conditions which, if not immediately
diagnosed and treated, could lead to serious physical or
mental disability or death.

26 2. "Substantial professional experience" shall be 27 determined by the custom and practice of the manner in which 28 emergency medical coverage is provided in hospital emergency 29 departments in the same or similar localities where the 30 alleged negligence occurred.

31

7

1 (12) However, if any health care providers described in subsection (2), subsection (3), or subsection (4) are 2 3 providing treatment or diagnosis for a condition that is not within his or her specialty, a specialist trained in the 4 5 treatment or diagnosis for that condition shall be considered б a "similar health care provider." 7 Section 2. Effective October 1, 2001, and applicable 8 to notices of intent to litigate sent on or after that date, subsection (2) and paragraph (a) of subsection (7) of section 9 10 766.106, Florida Statutes, are amended to read: 11 766.106 Notice before filing action for medical malpractice; presuit screening period; offers for admission of 12 liability and for arbitration; informal discovery; review.--13 (2) After completion of presuit investigation pursuant 14 to s. 766.203 and prior to filing a claim for medical 15 malpractice, a claimant shall notify each prospective 16 17 defendant and, if any prospective defendant is a health care provider licensed under chapter 458, chapter 459, chapter 460, 18 19 chapter 461, or chapter 466, the Department of Health by 20 certified mail, return receipt requested, of intent to 21 initiate litigation for medical malpractice. Notice to each prospective defendant must include a list of all known health 22 care providers seen by the claimant subsequent to the alleged 23 24 act of malpractice for the injuries complained of and those 25 known health care providers seen by the claimant for related conditions during the 5-year period prior to the alleged act 26 27 of malpractice.Notice to the Department of Health must include the full name and address of the claimant; the full 28 29 names and any known addresses of any health care providers licensed under chapter 458, chapter 459, chapter 460, chapter 30 31 461, or chapter 466 who are prospective defendants identified

8

1 at the time; the date and a summary of the occurrence giving 2 rise to the claim; and a description of the injury to the 3 claimant. The requirement for notice to the Department of Health does not impair the claimant's legal rights or ability 4 5 to seek relief for his or her claim, and the notice provided б to the department is not discoverable or admissible in any 7 civil or administrative action. The Department of Health shall review each incident and determine whether it involved conduct 8 by a licensee which is potentially subject to disciplinary 9 10 action, in which case the provisions of s. 455.621 apply. 11 (7) Informal discovery may be used by a party to obtain unsworn statements, the production of documents or 12 13 things, and physical and mental examinations, as follows: 14 (a) Unsworn statements. -- Any party may require other parties and the claimant's treating physicians listed in the 15 claimant's notice to initiate litigation for medical 16 17 malpractice to appear for the taking of an unsworn statement. 18 Such statements may be used only for the purpose of presuit 19 screening and are not discoverable or admissible in any civil 20 action for any purpose by any party. A party desiring to take the unsworn statement of any party or treating physician must 21 give reasonable notice in writing to all parties. The notice 22 must state the time and place for taking the statement and the 23 24 name and address of the party or treating physician to be examined. Unless otherwise impractical, the examination of 25 any party or treating physician must be done at the same time 26 by all other parties. Any party or treating physician may be 27 28 represented by counsel at the taking of an unsworn statement. 29 An unsworn statement may be recorded electronically, stenographically, or on videotape. The taking of unsworn 30 31 statements is subject to the provisions of the Florida Rules

9

of Civil Procedure and may be terminated for abuses. Further, 1 2 as to the taking of unsworn statements of the claimant's 3 treating physicians, the scope of such inquiry shall be 4 limited to opinions formulated by the treating physicians with 5 respect to the issues of liability and damages set forth in б the claimant's notice of intent letter. If a prospective 7 defendant did not take an unsworn statement of a claimant's 8 treating medical physicians as set forth in the claimant's 9 notice to initiate a claim for medical malpractice, an unsworn 10 statement may be taken after suit has been filed, but no later 11 than 90 days from the date of service of the complaint on the defendant. However, in no event may a prospective defendant 12 take more than one unsworn statement of a treating physician. 13 14 Unsworn statements taken after suit has been filed are inadmissible in the civil action for any purpose by any party. 15 This section does not prohibit the taking of an unsworn 16 17 statement of a treating physician subsequent to the filing of the civil action upon good cause being shown that the name of 18 19 any treating physician was not provided in the claimant's 20 notice to initiate a claim for medical malpractice. Section 3. Effective October 1, 2001, and applicable 21 22 to notices of intent to litigate sent on or after that date, subsection (5) of section 455.667, Florida Statutes, is 23 24 amended to read: 455.667 Ownership and control of patient records; 25 report or copies of records to be furnished .--26 27 (5) Except as otherwise provided in this section and 28 in s. 440.13(4)(c), such records may not be furnished to, and 29 the medical condition of a patient may not be discussed with, any person other than the patient or the patient's legal 30 31 representative or other health care practitioners and 10

1 providers involved in the care or treatment of the patient, 2 except upon written authorization of the patient. However, 3 such records may be furnished without written authorization under the following circumstances: 4 5 (a) To any person, firm, or corporation that has б procured or furnished such examination or treatment with the 7 patient's consent. 8 (b) When compulsory physical examination is made pursuant to Rule 1.360, Florida Rules of Civil Procedure, in 9 10 which case copies of the medical records shall be furnished to 11 both the defendant and the plaintiff. (c) In any civil or criminal action, unless otherwise 12 prohibited by law, upon the issuance of a subpoena from a 13 court of competent jurisdiction and proper notice to the 14 15 patient or the patient's legal representative by the party seeking such records. 16 17 (d) For statistical and scientific research, provided 18 the information is abstracted in such a way as to protect the 19 identity of the patient or provided written permission is 20 received from the patient or the patient's legal 21 representative. (e) For purposes of taking an <u>unsworn statement</u> 22 23 pursuant to s. 766.106(7)(a). 24 Section 4. This act shall take effect October 1, 2001, 25 and shall apply to causes of action accruing on or after that date. 26 27 28 29 30 31

SB 1446

i	
1	* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *
2	SENATE SUMMARY
3	Provides requirements for expert witness testimony in actions based on medical negligence. Requires claimants to provide a list of treating physicians. Provides for unsworn statements of physicians. Provides for unsworn statements after service of a complaint upon a defendant physician. Allows unsworn statements for good cause.
4	to provide a list of treating physicians. Provides for
5	statements after service of a complaint upon a defendant
6	phybrolan. Allowb andworn beacements for good caube.
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	
30	
31	
	12