

HB 1353

2004

1 A bill to be entitled

2 An act for the relief of Ashraf Kamel and Marguerite  
3 Dimitri by the Palm Beach County School Board; providing  
4 for an appropriation to compensate Ashraf Kamel and  
5 Marguerite Dimitri for the wrongful death of their minor  
6 child, Jean A. Pierre Kamel, as a result of the negligence  
7 of the Palm Beach County School Board; providing for  
8 payment of court costs; providing an effective date.  
9

10 WHEREAS, Jean A. Pierre Kamel, age 13, was killed on  
11 January 27, 1997, when he was shot by 14-year-old Tronneal  
12 Mangum in front of Conniston Middle School, a Palm Beach County  
13 public school, and

14 WHEREAS, Jean A. Pierre Kamel's surviving father, Ashraf  
15 Kamel, brought a wrongful-death action against the Palm Beach  
16 County School Board, seeking damages for Marguerite Dimitri,  
17 Jean's mother, and himself for their anguish and mental pain and  
18 suffering due to the tragic death of their minor son, and

19 WHEREAS, before the shooting occurred, the Palm Beach  
20 County School Board was on notice that Tronneal Mangum and Jean  
21 Kamel, both of whom were students at Conniston, had had numerous  
22 prior violent confrontations, including Mangum's kicking Jean  
23 Kamel in his prosthetic leg, and

24 WHEREAS, the Palm Beach County School Board was on notice  
25 that Jean Kamel and Tronneal Mangum had had a specific conflict  
26 because of which the students met with a guidance counselor and  
27 told the counselor that Mangum had a watch that belonged to Jean  
28 Kamel, and

29 WHEREAS, the Palm Beach County School Board, through its  
30 agents or employees, was negligent in directing Tronneal Mangum

HB 1353

2004

31 to personally return the watch to Jean Kamel the next day  
32 without the supervision or intervention of the school board, and

33 WHEREAS, the Palm Beach County School Board was on notice  
34 that Jean Kamel was fearful of Tronneal Mangum when he told an  
35 agent or employee of the school board that "Tronneal is out to  
36 get me" just days before he was shot and killed, and

37 WHEREAS, the Palm Beach County School Board was on notice  
38 that Tronneal Mangum lived in an area of West Palm Beach that  
39 has the highest incidence of crime, violence, and use and  
40 availability of firearms, and

41 WHEREAS, on the day of the shooting, Tronneal Mangum  
42 traveled to Conniston Middle School on the school bus with a  
43 loaded firearm and entered school property carrying the weapon,  
44 and

45 WHEREAS, the Palm Beach County School Board was on notice  
46 that students had brought firearms to Conniston Middle School on  
47 previous occasions, and

48 WHEREAS, on the date of the shooting, the Palm Beach County  
49 School Board failed to adequately supervise the students, in  
50 that agents or employees were not at their assigned posts,  
51 specifically, an armed police officer was not at the officer's  
52 post in front of the school where the shooting occurred, and

53 WHEREAS, the Palm Beach County School Board had a duty to  
54 take reasonable steps to protect its students, including Jean  
55 Kamel, from violence by other students while the students were  
56 on school premises for a reasonable time before classes  
57 commenced, and

58 WHEREAS, the Palm Beach County School Board was found to be  
59 negligent and to have failed to take reasonable steps to protect

HB 1353

2004

60 Jean Kamel, a physically handicapped student, from violence and  
61 harm by Tronneal Mangum, and

62 WHEREAS, as a result of the school board's negligence and  
63 failure to take reasonable steps to protect Jean Kamel, he was  
64 shot to death by Tronneal Mangum on school property within  
65 minutes before classes were scheduled to begin, and

66 WHEREAS, on February 8, 2002, a Palm Beach County jury  
67 found that the Palm Beach County School Board was negligent and  
68 80-percent liable for the death of Jean Kamel, and that Jean  
69 Kamel was 20-percent comparatively negligent for his own death,  
70 and

71 WHEREAS, the same jury determined that the damages of  
72 Ashraf Kamel and Marguerite Dimitri for their anguish and mental  
73 pain and suffering as a result of the negligence of the Palm  
74 Beach County School Board was \$2 million, and

75 WHEREAS, on February 22, 2002, the circuit court reduced  
76 the jury verdict to final judgment in the sum of \$1,602,400,  
77 based on the offset for 20-percent comparative negligence, and

78 WHEREAS, on May 14, 2002, the circuit court entered a cost  
79 judgment in favor of Ashraf Kamel in the amount of \$13,490, and

80 WHEREAS, the Palm Beach County School Board appealed the  
81 final judgment, and the Fourth District Court of Appeal rejected  
82 the appeal in a per curiam affirmed opinion issued on February  
83 12, 2003, and

84 WHEREAS, on February 27, 2003, the Palm Beach County School  
85 Board filed a Motion for Rehearing and Certification of Issues  
86 of Great Public Importance, which was denied by the Fourth  
87 District Court of Appeal on March 20, 2003, and

88 WHEREAS, on April 17, 2003, the Palm Beach County School  
89 Board tendered to Ashraf Kamel, as personal representative of

HB 1353

2004

90 the Estate of Jean A. Pierre Kamel, a payment of \$200,000, in  
91 accordance with the statutory limits of liability set forth in  
92 s. 768.28, Florida Statutes, and

93 WHEREAS, the remaining balance of the judgment is  
94 \$1,402,400, plus court costs in the amount of \$13,490, and

95 WHEREAS, Ashraf Kamel, as personal representative of the  
96 Estate of Jean A. Pierre Kamel, seeks satisfaction of the  
97 balance of the judgment, NOW, THEREFORE,

98

99 Be It Enacted by the Legislature of the State of Florida:

100

101 Section 1. The facts stated in the preamble to this act  
102 are found and declared to be true.

103 Section 2. The Palm Beach County School Board is  
104 authorized and directed to appropriate from funds of the school  
105 board not otherwise appropriated and to draw a warrant payable  
106 to Ashraf Kamel, as personal representative of the Estate of  
107 Jean A. Pierre Kamel, for the total amount of \$1,402,400, to  
108 compensate Ashraf Kamel and Marguerite Dimitri for injuries and  
109 damages sustained due to the death of Jean A. Pierre Kamel,  
110 minor son of Ashraf Kamel and Marguerite Dimitri, as a result of  
111 the negligence of the school board.

112 Section 3. The Palm Beach County School Board is  
113 authorized and directed to appropriate from funds of the school  
114 board not otherwise appropriated and to draw a warrant payable  
115 to Ashraf Kamel for the amount of \$13,490, to be paid as court  
116 costs incurred in the legal action arising out of the wrongful  
117 death of Jean A. Pierre Kamel, minor son of Ashraf Kamel and  
118 Marguerite Dimitri.

119 Section 4. This act shall take effect upon becoming a law.