

FULL ANALYSIS

I. SUBSTANTIVE ANALYSIS

A. HOUSE PRINCIPLES ANALYSIS:

Provide limited government – The bill creates career service boards to hear employee disciplinary cases. These career service boards have subpoena power as part of the disciplinary hearing process. The sheriff is granted rulemaking authority to implement the legislation.

B. EFFECT OF PROPOSED CHANGES:

Present Situation

Sixty-six of Florida's 67 counties have elected sheriffs as their chief law-enforcement officers. Miami-Dade County has an appointed chief law-enforcement officer whose title is Director of the Miami-Dade Police Department. Sheriffs serve four-year terms, and have county-wide jurisdiction that includes incorporated as well as unincorporated areas.

Pursuant to s. 14, Art. III of the State Constitution, s. 125.01(1)(u), F.S., and s. 30.53, F.S., a civil service system for sheriff's employees may be created by local governments via local ordinance. Section 14 of Art. III of the State Constitution provides:

By law there shall be created a civil service system for state employees, except those expressly exempted, and there may be created civil service systems and boards for county, district or municipal employees and for such offices thereof as are not elected or appointed by the governor, and there may be authorized such boards as are necessary to prescribe the qualifications, method of selection and tenure of such employees and officers.

The powers of the governing body of a county are set forth in s. 125.01, F.S. This power includes the authority, as provided in paragraph (u) of subsection (1) of s.125.01, F.S., to "[c]reate civil service systems and boards." While the independence of a sheriff is preserved in s. 30.53, F.S., that section contains a further provision that it not be construed to "restrict the establishment or operation of any civil service system" or board created pursuant to s. 14, Art. III of the State Constitution. See, also, City of Casselberry v. Orange County Police Benevolent Association, 482 So. 2d 336 (Fla. 1986) (providing that local governments are vested with the authority to establish civil service systems via local ordinance).

A number of sheriffs have civil service systems established by the Legislature through special act, including: Alachua (chs. 84-388 and 86-342, L.O.F.), Bay (ch. 84-390, L.O.F.), Brevard (ch. 83-373, L.O.F.), Broward (ch. 93-370, L.O.F.), Charlotte (chs. 79-436, 86-349 and 89-508, L.O.F.), Citrus (ch. 2001-296, L.O.F.), Clay (chs. 89-522 and 93-379, L.O.F.), Columbia (ch. 2004-413, L.O.F.), Escambia (ch. 89-492, L.O.F.), Flagler (chs. 90-450 and 2000-482, L.O.F.), Glades (ch. 2003-311, L.O.F.), Hernando (ch. 2000-414, L.O.F.), Indian River (ch. 2002-355, L.O.F.), Lake (chs. 90-386, 93-358 and 2005-349, L.O.F.), Lee (chs. 74-522, 87-547 and 95-514, L.O.F.), Leon (ch. 83-456, L.O.F.), Madison (95-470), Manatee (89-472), Marion (87-457), Martin (93-388), Monroe (78-567, 89-410, 89-461, 97-345 and 98-507, L.O.F.), Okaloosa (chs. 81-442, 85-472 and 90-492, L.O.F.), Orange (ch. 89-507, L.O.F.), Osceola (chs. 89-516 and 2000-388, L.O.F.), Palm Beach (chs. 93-367, 99-437 and 2004-404, L.O.F.), Pasco (ch. 90-491, L.O.F.), Pinellas (chs. 89-404 and 90-395, L.O.F.), Polk (chs. 88-443 and 98-516, L.O.F.), St. Lucie (ch. 89-475, L.O.F.), Santa Rosa (ch. 2002-385, L.O.F.), Sarasota (ch. 86-344, L.O.F.), and Seminole (ch. 77-653, 80-612, 88-451 and 97-376, L.O.F.) counties.

The Okeechobee County Sheriff's Office currently does not have a civil service system.¹

Effect of Proposed Changes

HB 1161 creates a career service system for employees of the Okeechobee County Sheriff's Office. The bill provides for the application of the act to all full-time sworn and civilian persons employed by the sheriff. Specifically excluded from the provisions of the act are:

- the sheriff;
- the undersheriff;
- special deputies appointed pursuant to s. 30.09(4), F. S.;²
- members of the sheriff's reserve/auxiliary units; or
- persons appointed as part-time deputy sheriffs as defined by the Criminal Justice Standards and Training Commission, unless any such person also is employed full time by the sheriff.

The bill states that it is not the intent of the act to grant collective bargaining rights to persons in the employ of the Okeechobee County Sheriff's Office who do not otherwise have that right pursuant to law.³

When a covered employee has completed one calendar year of service,⁴ the employee attains permanent status in the Sheriff's Office;⁵ however, if an employee is placed on disciplinary probation for a period of six months or more, or is terminated and rehired at a later date, the employee is required to repeat this probationary period. Any employee who is required to serve a probationary period attendant to a promotion retains his or her permanent status, but may be returned to his or her prior rank during such probationary period without the right of appeal.

Once an employee has achieved career service status within the Sheriff's Office, he or she may only be suspended or dismissed for cause. Prior to any such action, the employee must be furnished with written notice and offered an opportunity to respond. In extraordinary situations, an employee may be suspended or dismissed immediately with notice provided within 24 hours or as soon as is practicable.

"Cause for suspension or dismissal" includes, but is not limited to:

- negligence;
- inefficiency or inability to perform assigned duties;
- insubordination;
- violation of provisions of law or office rules;
- conduct unbecoming a public employee;

¹ The terms "civil service system" and "career service system" are used interchangeably.

² This section designates special deputy sheriffs appointed by the sheriff: (a) to attend elections on election days; (b) to perform undercover investigative work; (c) for specific guard or police duties in connection with public sporting or entertainment events, not to exceed 30 days; or for watch or guard duties, when serving in such capacity at specified locations or areas only; (d) for special and temporary duties, without power of arrest, in connection with guarding or transporting prisoners; (e) to aid in preserving law and order, or to give necessary assistance in the event of any threatened or actual hurricane, fire, flood or other natural disaster, or in the event of any major tragedy such as an act of local terrorism or a national terrorism alert, an airplane crash, a train or automobile wreck, or a similar accident; (f) to raise the power of the county, by calling bystanders or others, to assist in quelling a riot or any breach of the peace, when ordered by the sheriff or an authorized general deputy; (g) to serve as a parking enforcement specialist pursuant to s. 316.640(2), F.S.

³Section 6, Art. I of the State Constitution grants public employees the right to collectively bargain. In 2003, the Florida Supreme Court held that deputy sheriffs were "employees" for purposes of this constitutional right. See, Coastal Florida Police Benevolent Association, Inc. v. Williams, 838 So.2d 543 (Fla. 2003).

⁴ All time of employment while in a Criminal Justice Standards and Training Commission-approved academy or other comparable training for certification as a sworn officer or deputy sheriff is not counted in determining whether an employee has attained one calendar year of minimum service.

⁵ All sworn and civilian persons in the employ of the sheriff on the effective date of the act who have served for a period of one calendar year or more are considered career service employees. All other employees achieve this status subject to the provisions of the act upon reaching their one-calendar-year service anniversary.

- misconduct;
- alcohol abuse;
- prescription drug abuse, or illegal drug use;
- adjudication of guilt by a court of competent jurisdiction;
- a plea of guilty or of nolo contendere; or
- a verdict of guilty when adjudication of guilt is withheld and the accused is placed on probation with respect to any felony, misdemeanor or major traffic infraction charges.

When a newly elected or appointed sheriff assumes office, he or she is required to continue the employment of all career service personnel unless cause for dismissal exists. The sheriff has the right to replace persons serving in the rank of captain or above, including the executive secretary, with personnel of his or her choosing. The sheriff may offer these persons any position that the sheriff chooses, or to cease their employment with the department. Career service employees holding the rank of lieutenant may be reduced to the next lowest rank at the current maximum pay step.⁶ These actions are not appealable, nor are dismissals or demotions pursuant to across-the-board actions directed by the Okeechobee County Board of Commissioners, resulting from county fiscal impacts.

Ad hoc career service appeal boards are appointed for the purpose of hearing appeals arising from personnel actions which result in dismissal, suspension, demotion or reduction in pay. Lateral transfers, shift changes, oral or written reprimands, and suspensions of three working days or less (unless it is a subsequent such suspension within one calendar year) are not appealable. The scope of a career service appeal board is limited to disciplinary proceedings and termination actions. A career service appeal board has the authority to conduct hearings, and make findings of fact and recommendations to the sheriff. The board has no investigative powers.

A career service appeal board consists of three members of the Office of the Sheriff. The sheriff selects one member; the employee requesting the hearing selects another member; and these two individuals select a third member, who must hold the rank of lieutenant or above, to serve as chairperson. Each selected member is uncompensated, has the right to decline to serve, and must have no involvement with the issues under consideration.

A request for a hearing must be made in writing to the employee's immediate supervisor within 10 working days after notice of an appealable disciplinary action. The request must contain a brief statement of the matters to be considered by the board, and the name of the employee selected to be a board member. The supervisor is required to immediately forward the hearing request to the sheriff and the appropriate division commander. A career service appeal board must be impaneled and a hearing date scheduled by the sheriff within 10 working days after receipt of the request, unless this deadline is waived in writing by the employee. When summary discipline is imposed by any supervisor, the sheriff may order a career service appeal board to convene and review the action.

The employee and his or her representative has the right to be present during the hearing, and to offer any relevant evidence on the employee's behalf. During such hearings, the rules of evidence and civil or criminal rules of procedure are not applied. All witnesses must be notified in writing by the chairperson of the board, through the appropriate chain of command, of the date and time of the convening of the board. The board has the power to issue subpoenas upon request of any party or upon its own motion. Employees and their representatives have the opportunity to present evidence, conduct cross-examination, and submit rebuttal evidence.

The board must submit its written findings and recommendations to the sheriff within five days after the hearing. It may make any recommended disposition, including, but not limited to, oral or verbal reprimand, suspension, reduction of rank, termination of employment, sustention or reversal of the original decision, or recommendation of a more severe disposition. The sheriff is required to notify the employee of the decision of the career service appeal board. However, the sheriff has the right to make

⁶ While this action would constitute a "demotion," it would not be "disciplinary," and thus not appealable, as specified by the act.

a final determination in the matter. In the event an employee is exonerated, he or she must be reinstated without prejudice or penalty.

No sworn or civilian employee of the Sheriff's Office may be discharged, disciplined, demoted, denied promotion or reassignment, or otherwise discriminated against in regard to his or her employment or appointment, or be threatened with any such treatment, in retaliation for exercising the rights granted by the act.

The Sheriff is authorized to adopt such rules, regulations and procedures necessary for the administration and implementation of the act, although it is specified that nothing in the act may be construed as affecting the budget-making powers of the Okeechobee County Board of Commissioners.

The bill provides an effective date of upon becoming a law.

C. SECTION DIRECTORY:

Section 1 provides for applicability of the act; permanent status of employees; cause for suspension or dismissal; transition of career service employees; and administration.

Section 2 provides for career service appeal boards; creation; membership; and duties.

Section 3 provides for status as permanent employees; and prohibits actions to circumvent act.

Section 4 provides an effective date of upon becoming a law.

II. NOTICE/REFERENDUM AND OTHER REQUIREMENTS

A. NOTICE PUBLISHED? Yes No

IF YES, WHEN? January 18, 2006

WHERE? *The Okeechobee News*, a daily newspaper published in Okeechobee County, Florida.

B. REFERENDUM(S) REQUIRED? Yes No

IF YES, WHEN?

C. LOCAL BILL CERTIFICATION FILED? Yes, attached No

D. ECONOMIC IMPACT STATEMENT FILED? Yes, attached No

According to the Economic Impact Statement, the bill will have no fiscal impact.

III. COMMENTS

A. CONSTITUTIONAL ISSUES:

None.

B. RULE-MAKING AUTHORITY:

The Sheriff is authorized to adopt such rules, regulations and procedures necessary for the administration and implementation of the act, although it is specified that nothing in the act may be construed as affecting the budget-making powers of the Okeechobee County Board of Commissioners.

C. DRAFTING ISSUES OR OTHER COMMENTS:

Drafting Issues

The Sponsor may want to amend the bill to clarify that a promoted employee is required to serve a probationary period for his or her new position; and that those serving in the rank of captain or above, and the executive secretary, are not employed in career service positions.

IV. AMENDMENTS/COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTE & COMBINED BILL CHANGES

Not applicable.