



THE FLORIDA SENATE

SPECIAL MASTER ON CLAIM BILLS

Location

402 Senate Office Building

Mailing Address

404 South Monroe Street
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-1100
(850) 487-5237

DATE	COMM	ACTION
1/31/17	SM	Favorable
2/22/17	JU	Fav/CS
	CA	
	RC	

January 31, 2017

The Honorable Joe Negrón
President, The Florida Senate
Suite 409, The Capitol
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-1100

Re: **CS/SB 36** – Judiciary Committee and Senator Bill Montford
Relief of Jennifer Wohlgemuth

SPECIAL MASTER'S FINAL REPORT

THIS IS A MEDIATED SETTLED EXCESS JUDGMENT CLAIM FOR \$2.6 MILLION AGAINST THE PASCO COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE TO COMPENSATE JENNIFER WOHLGEMUTH FOR INJURIES SUSTAINED IN A MOTOR VEHICLE CRASH RESULTING FROM THE NEGLIGENT OPERATION OF A POLICE VEHICLE.

CURRENT STATUS:

On December 2, 2011, an administrative law judge from the Division of Administrative Hearings, serving as a Senate special master, issued a report after holding a de novo hearing on a previous version of this bill, SB 22 (2012). The judge's report contained findings of fact and conclusions of law and recommended that the bill be reported favorably with one amendment. That report is attached as an addendum to this report.

PRIOR LEGISLATIVE HISTORY: Senate Bill 50 by Senator Smith and House Bill 1347 were filed during the 2011 Legislative Session. The Senate Bill was indefinitely postponed and withdrawn from consideration. The House Bill died in its only committee of reference. Senate Bill 22 by Senator Smith and House Bill 1353 were filed during the 2012 Legislative Session. The Senate Bill passed with one amendment in all its committees

of reference but died in Messages. The House Bill died in its only committee of reference.

Senate Bill 30 filed by Senator Montford and House Bill 3535 by Representative Rouson were filed during the 2015 Legislative Session. The Senate Bill passed favorably with one amendment in the Judiciary Committee but died in the Community Affairs Committee. The House Bill died in the first committee of reference.

Senate Bill 62 was filed by Senator Montford during the 2016 Legislative Session. The bill passed the Judiciary Committee but died in the Community Affairs Committee. The bill did not have a House Companion.

According to counsel for the parties, there have been no substantial changes in the facts and circumstances for the underlying claim since the claim bill hearing. Accordingly, I find no cause to alter the findings and recommendations of the original report.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

For the reasons set forth above the undersigned recommends that Senate Bill 36 be reported favorably.

Respectfully submitted,

Tracy Jeanne Sumner
Senate Special Master

cc: Secretary of the Senate

CS by Judiciary:

The committee substitute, in conformity with a recent opinion of the Florida Supreme Court, does not include the limits on costs, lobbying fees, and other similar expenses, which were included in the original bill.



THE FLORIDA SENATE
SPECIAL MASTER ON CLAIM BILLS

Location
402 Senate Office Building

Mailing Address
404 South Monroe Street
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-1100
(850) 487-5237

DATE	COMM	ACTION
12/2/11	SM	Fav/1 amendment

December 2, 2011

The Honorable Mike Haridopolos
President, The Florida Senate
Suite 409, The Capitol
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-1100

Re: **SB 22 (2012)** – Senator Christopher L. Smith
Relief of Jennifer Wohlgemuth

SPECIAL MASTER'S FINAL REPORT

THIS IS A CONTESTED CLAIM FOR \$8,624,754.40 BASED ON A BENCH TRIAL AWARD FOR JENNIFER WOHLGEMUTH AGAINST THE PASCO COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE TO COMPENSATE CLAIMANT FOR INJURIES SUSTAINED IN A MOTOR VEHICLE CRASH RESULTING FROM THE NEGLIGENT OPERATION OF A POLICE VEHICLE.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

On January 3, 2005, at approximately 1:35 a.m., the Claimant, Jennifer Wohlgemuth, was operating her Honda Accord southbound on Regency Park Boulevard in New Port Richey, Florida. The Claimant, who was not wearing her seatbelt, was in the process of dropping off several passengers with whom she had been socializing earlier that evening.

As the Claimant headed southbound on Regency Park Boulevard, she approached the intersection of Ridge Road, which is controlled by a traffic light in all four directions. Unbeknownst to the Claimant, a fleeing motorist, Scott Eddins, had proceeded through the intersection a short time earlier headed eastbound on Ridge Road. Closely pursuing Mr. Eddins were three police vehicles with the Port Richey and New Port Richey Police Departments. A fourth law enforcement vehicle, operated by Pasco County Sheriff's

Deputy Kenneth Petrillo, was well behind the pursuit and trailed the other patrol cars by 10 to 30 seconds.

Although the traffic signal at the intersection was red for vehicles traveling eastbound on Ridge Road, Deputy Petrillo entered the intersection against the light, without slowing, at a rate of travel that substantially exceeded the 45 MPH speed limit. Although Deputy Petrillo's patrol vehicle was equipped with a siren, he neglected to activate it. Almost immediately upon entering the intersection, Deputy Petrillo struck the front right portion of the Claimant's Honda Accord, which had lawfully proceeded into the intersection several seconds earlier.

As a result of the impact, which was devastating, the Claimant's vehicle traveled approximately 15 feet across a grass shoulder and sidewalk, at which point it struck a metal railing and came to rest. The front right of the Claimant's vehicle was demolished, and the entire right side was dented with inward intrusion. In addition, the front windshield, rear windshield, and right side windows were shattered and broken away.

The Claimant exited her vehicle following the collision, but collapsed in the roadway moments later due to the serious nature of her injuries. The Claimant was subsequently transported to Bayfront Medical Center for treatment.

Shortly after the accident, Florida Highway Patrol Corporal Erik W. Bromiley initiated an investigation to determine the cause of the collision. During his investigation, Corporal Bromiley learned that three Alprazolam (an anti-depressant) tablets, totaling 1.8 grams, had been discovered in the Claimant's wallet. In addition, several witnesses advised Corporal Bromiley that the Claimant had consumed alcoholic beverages at a bar earlier in the evening. Ultimately, however, Corporal Bromiley could not conclude that the Claimant was impaired by drugs or alcohol at the time of the accident.

While Corporal Bromiley remained at the scene to question witnesses and inspect the crash site, a second trooper responded to Bayfront Medical Center and obtained blood samples from the Claimant. Testing of the blood, which was drawn approximately two and one-half hours after the

accident, revealed that the Claimant's blood alcohol level was .021 and .022, which is below the legal limit of .08. In addition, cocaine metabolites and Alprazolam were detected.

Jeffrey Hayes, a toxicologist employed with the Pinellas County Forensic Laboratory, estimated that at the time of the accident, the Claimant's blood alcohol level could have ranged from .047 (a level in which the driver is presumed not to be impaired pursuant to Florida law) to .097, which would exceed the legal limit. Significantly, Mr. Hayes conceded that any conclusion that the Claimant was impaired when the collision occurred would be purely speculative.

Accident reconstruction established that Deputy Petrillo was travelling between 64 MPH (with a margin of error of plus or minus 5 MPH) in a 45 MPH zone. It was further estimated that the Claimant was travelling 34 MPH, in excess of the posted 30 MPH limit for Regency Park Boulevard. However, with the margin of error of plus or minus 5 MPH, the accident reconstruction findings do not preclude a determination that the Claimant was observing the speed limit.

Although it is clear that Deputy Petrillo's siren was not activated prior to the collision, the evidence is inconclusive regarding the use of the patrol vehicle's emergency lights.

An additional investigation of the accident was conducted by Inspector Art Fremer with the Pasco County Sheriff's Office Professional Standards Unit. The purpose of Inspector Fremer's investigation was to ascertain if Deputy Petrillo had committed any statutory violations or failed to observe the policies of the Pasco County Sheriff's Office. At the conclusion of his investigation, Investigator Fremer determined that Deputy Petrillo violated General Order 41.3 of the Pasco County Sheriff's Office in the following respects: (1) failing to activate and continuously use a siren while engaged in emergency operations; (2) entering the intersection against a red light without slowing or stopping, which was necessary for safe operation; (3) entering the intersection at a speed greater than reasonable; and (4) failing to ensure that cross-traffic flow had yielded. In addition, Investigator Fremer concluded that Deputy Petrillo had violated s. 316.072(5), Florida Statutes, which provides that the operator of an emergency vehicle may exceed the maximum speed limit "as long as the driver does not endanger

life or property." As a result of his misconduct, Deputy Petrillo was suspended for 30 days without pay.

With respect to the Claimant's driving, the undersigned credits the testimony of Amanda Dunn, an eyewitness driving three to four car lengths behind the Claimant, who noticed no unusual driving and testified that the "coast was clear" when the Claimant entered the intersection. Accordingly, the undersigned finds that she operated her vehicle in accordance with the law and did not contribute to the accident.

As a result of the collision, the Claimant suffered severe closed head trauma, which included a subdural hematoma of the right frontal lobe and a subarachnoid hemorrhage. As a result of significant swelling to her brain, a portion of the Claimant's skull was removed. The Claimant remained in a coma for approximately three weeks following the accident, and did not return home until August of 2005.

At the time of the final hearing in this matter, the Claimant continues to suffer from severe impairment to her memory, a partial loss of vision, poor balance, urinary problems, anxiety, dysarthric speech, and weight fluctuations. Further, the damage to the Claimant's frontal lobe has left her with the behavior, judgment, and impulses similar to those of a seven-year-old child. As a consequence, the Claimant requires constant supervision and is unable to hold a job, drive, or live independently.

LITIGATION HISTORY:

On March 17, 2007, the Claimant filed an Amended Complaint for Negligence and Demand for Jury Trial in the Sixth Judicial Circuit, in and for Pasco County. In her Amended Complaint, the Claimant sued Robert White, as Sheriff of Pasco County, for injuries she sustained as a result of Deputy Petrillo's negligence. On March 9-11, Circuit Judge Stanley R. Mills conducted a bench trial of the Claimant's negligence claim.

On March 12, 2009, Judge Mills rendered a verdict in favor of the Claimant and awarded:

- \$299,284.32 for past medical expenses.
- \$5,786,983.00 for future medical expenses.
- \$1,055,000.00 for future lost earnings.

- \$500,000.00 for past pain and suffering.
- \$1,500,000 for future pain and suffering.

The trial judge further determined that Deputy Petrillo was 95 percent responsible for the Claimant's injuries, and that the Claimant was 5 percent responsible due to her failure to wear a seatbelt. With the allocation of 5 percent responsibility to the Claimant, the final judgment for the Claimant totaled \$8,724,754.50.

The Respondent appealed the final judgment to the Second District Court of Appeal. In its initial brief, the Respondent argued that the trial court erred by: (1) failing to allocate any responsibility to the Claimant based upon her blood alcohol level; (2) awarding lost wages that were not supported by competent substantial evidence; (3) failing to allocate any responsibility to the Claimant based upon her driving in excess of the speed limit; and (4) failing to allocate any responsibility to the Scott Eddins, the fleeing motorist. Oral argument was granted, and on March 10, 2010, the Second District Court of Appeal affirmed the trial court without a written opinion.

CLAIMANT'S ARGUMENTS:

- Deputy Petrillo's negligent operation of his patrol vehicle was the proximate cause of the Claimant's injuries.
- The trial court's findings as to damages and the apportionment of liability were appropriate.

RESPONDENT'S ARGUMENTS:

- The Pasco County Sheriff's Office objects to any payment to the Claimant through a claim bill.
- At the time of the collision, the Claimant was not wearing her seat belt and was impaired by alcohol, drugs, or a combination of the two, and as such, more than 5 percent of the fault should be allocated to her.
- Some responsibility should be apportioned to Scott Eddins, who was being pursued by multiple law enforcement vehicles at the time Deputy Petrillo collided with the Claimant's vehicle.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

Deputy Petrillo had a duty to operate his vehicle at all times with consideration for the safety of other drivers. See City of Pinellas Park v. Brown, 604 So. 2d 1222, 1226 (Fla. 1992) (holding officers conducting a high-speed chase of a man who ran a red light had a duty to reasonably safeguard surrounding motorists); Brown v. Miami-Dade Cnty., 837 So. 2d 414, 417 (Fla. 3d DCA 2001) ("Florida courts have found that police officers do owe a duty to exercise reasonable care to protect innocent bystanders . . . when their law enforcement activities create a foreseeable zone of risk"); Creamer v. Sampson, 700 So. 2d 711 (Fla. 2d DCA 1997) (holding police owed duty to innocent motorist during high speed pursuit of traffic offender). It was entirely foreseeable that injuries to motorists such as the Claimant could occur where Deputy Petrillo entered an intersection at a high rate of speed, without slowing, against a red light, and without his siren activated. Further, Deputy Petrillo failed to comply with s. 316.072(5), Florida Statutes, which provides that the operator of an emergency vehicle may exceed the maximum speed limit "as long as the driver does not endanger life or property." Deputy Petrillo breached his duty of care and the breach was the proximate cause of the Claimant's injuries.

The Pasco County Sheriff's Office, as Deputy Petrillo's employer, is liable for his negligent act. Mercury Motors Express v. Smith, 393 So. 2d 545, 549 (Fla. 1981) (holding that an employer is vicariously liable for compensatory damages resulting from the negligent acts of employees committed within the scope of their employment).

The circuit judge's allocation of 95 percent liability to the Pasco County Sheriff's Office is reasonable and should not be disturbed. The evidence failed to establish that the Claimant was impaired or that her operation of the vehicle contributed to the accident. Further, as Deputy Petrillo was well behind the pursuit, the zone of risk created by Scott Eddins (the fleeing motorist) had moved beyond the intersection of Regency Park Boulevard and Ridge Road at the time of the collision. Accordingly, the trial court correctly determined that no fault should be apportioned to Mr. Eddins.

The undersigned further concludes that the damages awarded to the Claimant were appropriate. This includes the \$1,055,000.00 for future lost earnings, which was based on the reasonable and conservative assumption that the

Claimant did not possess a high school diploma, when in fact she had graduated from high school and planned to attend community college.

LEGISLATIVE HISTORY:

This is the second year that a bill has been filed on the Claimant's behalf. During the 2011 session, the bill (SB 50) was indefinitely postponed and withdrawn from consideration on May 7, 2011.

ATTORNEYS FEES:

The Claimant's attorneys have agreed to limit their fees to 25 percent of any amount awarded by the Legislature in compliance with s. 768.28(8), Florida Statutes.

FISCAL IMPACT:

The Respondent has already paid the statutory maximum of \$100,000.00, leaving \$8,624,754.40 unpaid. Pursuant to the Sheriff's Automobile Risk Program (a self-insurance pool), an additional \$332,000 is at the Respondent's disposal. The remaining balance would be paid by Pasco County funds. Respondent's General Counsel, Jeremiah Hawkes, advises that the Pasco County Sheriff's Office is in the midst of a significant budget crisis that would be exacerbated by the passage of the instant claim bill.

Notwithstanding the Respondent's budgetary woes, the undersigned concludes that the Claimant is presently entitled to the full amount sought. In the alternative, it would not be inappropriate to amend Senate Bill 22 to direct Respondent to pay the balance of \$8,624,754.40 over a period of years.

COLLATERAL SOURCES:

The Claimant receives \$221 per month in Social Security Disability Insurance.

SPECIAL ISSUES:

Senate Bill 22, as it is presently drafted, provides that Deputy Petrillo failed to activate his patrol vehicle's emergency lights. In light of the undersigned's finding that the evidenced is inconclusive regarding the use of emergency lights, Senate Bill 22 should be amended accordingly.

The Respondent introduced evidence that that the Claimant began using marijuana at the age of 16, as well as cocaine several years later. Although the Claimant sought help for her addictions, she voluntarily terminated treatment roughly two weeks prior to the collision with Deputy Petrillo's vehicle. As there was no evidence that the Claimant was impaired at the time of the accident, the undersigned concludes that the

Claimant's history of drug addiction should not militate against the passage of the instant claim bill.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

For the reasons set forth above, the undersigned recommends that Senate Bill 22 (2012) be reported FAVORABLY, as amended.

Respectfully submitted,

Edward T. Bauer
Senate Special Master

cc: Senator Christopher L. Smith
Debbie Brown, Interim Secretary of the Senate
Counsel of Record