

The Florida Senate
BILL ANALYSIS AND FISCAL IMPACT STATEMENT

(This document is based on the provisions contained in the legislation as of the latest date listed below.)

Prepared By: The Professional Staff of the Committee on Governmental Oversight and Accountability

BILL: SB 7004

INTRODUCER: Judiciary Committee

SUBJECT: OGSR/Petitioner Information/Notification of Service of an Injunction for Protection

DATE: December 4, 2017 REVISED: _____

	ANALYST	STAFF DIRECTOR	REFERENCE	ACTION
	<u>Brown</u>	<u>Cibula</u>		JU Submitted as Committee Bill
1.	<u>Brown</u>	<u>Caldwell</u>	<u>GO</u>	Pre-meeting
2.	_____	_____	<u>RC</u>	_____

I. Summary:

SB 7004 is based on an Open Government Sunset Review of two public records exemptions. These exemptions prohibit the disclosure of contact information maintained on a database by the Florida Association of Court Clerks and Comptrollers for a petitioner who is granted an injunction for protection against domestic violence or repeat, sexual, or dating violence. The exemptions are scheduled for repeal on October 2, 2018.

The clerks are currently updating their database. Once completed, the database will include a process by which a petitioner is automatically notified that an injunction has been served. Although the automatic notification process is not yet in operation, the justification for the original exemption remains valid. Additionally, other public records exemptions protect this contact information. For these reasons, the bill repeals the automatic repeal of the public records exemptions provided in ss. 741.30(8)(c)5.b. and 784.046(8)(c)5.b., F.S.

Accordingly, the Open Government Sunset Review Act does not require another review of the exemptions unless they are broadened or expanded.

The bill takes effect October 1, 2018.

II. Present Situation:

Public Records Law

The Florida Constitution provides that the public has the right to inspect or copy records made or received in connection with official governmental business.¹ This applies to the official business

¹ FLA. CONST., art. I, s. 24(a).

of any public body, officer, or employee of the state, including all three branches of state government, local governmental entities, and any person acting on behalf of the government.²

In addition to the Florida Constitution, the Florida Statutes provide that the public may access legislative and executive branch records.³ Chapter 119, F.S., constitutes the main body of public records laws, and is known as the Public Records Act.⁴ The Public Records Act states that

it is the policy of this state that all state, county and municipal records are open for personal inspection and copying by any person. Providing access to public records is a duty of each agency.⁵

According to the Public Records Act, a public record includes virtually any document or recording, regardless of its physical form or how it may be transmitted.⁶ The Florida Supreme Court has interpreted public records as being “any material prepared in connection with official agency business which is intended to perpetuate, communicate or formalize knowledge of some type.”⁷ A violation of the Public Records Act may result in civil or criminal liability.⁸

The Legislature may create an exemption to open meetings requirements by passing a general law by a two-thirds vote of the House and the Senate.⁹ The exemption must explicitly lay out the public necessity justifying the exemption, and must be no broader than necessary to accomplish the stated purpose of the exemption.¹⁰ A statutory exemption which does not meet these two criteria may be unconstitutional and may not be judicially saved.¹¹

² FLA. CONST., art. I, s. 24(a).

³ The Public Records Act does not apply to legislative or judicial records. *Locke v. Hawkes*, 595 So. 2d 32 (Fla. 1992). Also see *Times Pub. Co. v. Ake*, 660 So. 2d 255 (Fla. 1995). The Legislature’s records are public pursuant to s. 11.0431, F.S. Public records exemptions for the Legislature are primarily located in s. 11.0431(2)-(3), F.S.

⁴ Public records laws are found throughout the Florida Statutes.

⁵ Section 119.01(1), F.S.

⁶ Section 119.011(12), F.S., defines “public record” to mean “all documents, papers, letters, maps, books, tapes, photographs, films, sound recordings, data processing software, or other material, regardless of the physical form, characteristics, or means of transmission, made or received pursuant to law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business by any agency.” Section 119.011(2), F.S., defines “agency” as “any state, county, district, authority, or municipal officer, department, division, board, bureau, commission, or other separate unit of government created or established by law including, for the purposes of this chapter, the Commission on Ethics, the Public Service Commission, and the Office of Public Counsel, and any other public or private agency, person, partnership, corporation, or business entity acting on behalf of any public agency.”

⁷ *Shevin v. Byron, Harless, Schaffer, Reid and Assoc. Inc.*, 379 So. 2d 633, 640 (Fla. 1980).

⁸ Section 119.10, F.S. Public records laws are found throughout the Florida Statutes, as are the penalties for violating those laws.

⁹ FLA. CONST., art. I, s. 24(c).

¹⁰ FLA. CONST., art. I, s. 24(c).

¹¹ *Halifax Hosp. Medical Center v. New-Journal Corp.*, 724 So. 2d 567 (Fla. 1999). In *Halifax Hospital*, the Florida Supreme Court found that a public meetings exemption was unconstitutional because the statement of public necessity did not define important terms and did not justify the breadth of the exemption. *Id.* at 570. The Florida Supreme Court also declined to narrow the exemption in order to save it. *Id.* In *Baker County Press, Inc. v. Baker County Medical Services, Inc.*, 870 So. 2d 189 (Fla. 1st DCA 2004), the court found that the intent of a statute was to create a public records exemption. The *Baker County Press* court found that since the law did not contain a public necessity statement, it was unconstitutional. *Id.* at 196.

When creating a public records exemption, the Legislature may provide that a record is ‘confidential and exempt’ or ‘exempt.’¹² Records designated as ‘confidential and exempt’ may be released by the records custodian only under the circumstances defined by the Legislature. Records designated as ‘exempt’ may be released at the discretion of the records custodian under certain circumstances.¹³

Open Government Sunset Review Act

The Open Government Sunset Review Act (referred to hereafter as the “OGSR”) prescribes a legislative review process for newly created or substantially amended public records or open meetings exemptions.¹⁴ The OGSR provides that an exemption automatically repeals on October 2nd of the fifth year after creation or substantial amendment; in order to save an exemption from repeal, the Legislature must reenact the exemption.¹⁵ In practice, many exemptions are continued by repealing the sunset date rather than reenacting the exemption.

The OGSR provides that a public records or open meetings exemption may be created or maintained only if it serves an identifiable public purpose and is no broader than is necessary.¹⁶ An exemption serves an identifiable purpose if it meets one of the following purposes *and* the Legislature finds that the purpose of the exemption outweighs open government policy and cannot be accomplished without the exemption:

- It allows the state or its political subdivision to effectively and efficiently administer a program, and administration would be significantly impaired without the exemption;¹⁷
- Releasing sensitive personal information would be defamatory or would jeopardize an individual’s safety. If this public purpose is cited as the basis of an exemption, however, only personal identifying information is exempt;¹⁸ or
- It protects trade or business secrets.¹⁹

The OGSR also requires specified questions to be considered during the review process.²⁰ In examining an exemption, the OGSR asks the Legislature to carefully question the purpose and necessity of reenacting the exemption.

¹² If the Legislature designates a record as confidential, such record may not be released to anyone other than the persons or entities specifically designated in the statutory exemption. *WFTV, Inc. v. The School Board of Seminole*, 874 So. 2d 48 (Fla. 5th DCA 2004).

¹³ A record classified as exempt from public disclosure may be disclosed under certain circumstances. *Williams v. City of Minneola*, 575 So. 2d 683 (Fla. 5th DCA 1991).

¹⁴ Section 119.15, F.S. Section 119.15(4)(b), F.S., provides that an exemption is considered to be substantially amended if it is expanded to include more information or to include meetings. The OGSR does not apply to an exemption that is required by federal law or that applies solely to the Legislature or the State Court System pursuant to section 119.15(2), F.S.

¹⁵ Section 119.15(3), F.S.

¹⁶ Section 119.15(6)(b), F.S.

¹⁷ Section 119.15(6)(b)1., F.S.

¹⁸ Section 119.15(6)(b)2., F.S.

¹⁹ Section 119.15(6)(b)3., F.S.

²⁰ Section 119.15(6)(a), F.S. The specified questions are:

- What specific records or meetings are affected by the exemption?
- Whom does the exemption uniquely affect, as opposed to the general public?
- What is the identifiable public purpose or goal of the exemption?
- Can the information contained in the records or discussed in the meeting be readily obtained by alternative means? If so, how?

If, in reenacting an exemption, the exemption is expanded, then a public necessity statement and a two-thirds vote for passage are required.²¹ If the exemption is reenacted without substantive changes or if the exemption is narrowed, then a public necessity statement and a two-thirds vote for passage are *not* required. If the Legislature allows an exemption to sunset, the previously exempt records will remain exempt unless provided for by law.²²

Injunction for Protection

A person may file a petition for an injunction for protection against domestic violence,²³ or repeat, sexual, or dating violence.²⁴

Filing a petition for a protective injunction is a civil cause of action.²⁵

Process for Injunction for Petition

Filing of the Petition

A person wishing to initiate an injunction for protection against domestic violence must file a sworn petition for the injunction at the clerk's office for the circuit court.²⁶ Clerks' offices must provide a simplified petition form for the injunction for protection, including instructions for the petitioner to follow.²⁷ A sample form for a petition for injunction for protection against domestic violence is provided in statute and requires:

- A detailed description of the respondent;
- The residential and employment address of the respondent;
- The relationship between the respondent and the petitioner;
- A detailed description of the violence or threat of violence;
- An indication of prior or pending attempts by the petitioner to obtain an injunction;

-
- Is the record or meeting protected by another exemption?
 - Are there multiple exemptions for the same type of record or meeting that it would be appropriate to merge?

²¹ FLA. CONST. art. I, s. 24(c).

²² Section 119.15(7), F.S.

²³ Section 741.30(1), F.S., creates a cause of action for an injunction for protection against domestic violence.

Section 741.30(1)(a), F.S., requires a petitioner to either be the victim of domestic violence or reasonably believe he or she is in imminent danger of becoming a victim.

²⁴ Section 784.046(2), F.S., creates a cause of action for an injunction for protection individually against repeat violence, dating violence, and sexual violence. Section 784.046(2)(a), F.S., requires a petitioner to either be the victim or the parent or guardian of a minor child who is a victim of repeat violence. Section 784.046(2)(b), F.S., requires a petitioner to either have reasonable cause to believe he or she is in imminent danger to another act of dating violence, whether or not he or she has previously been the victim of dating violence, or if a minor, be the parent or guardian of the minor. Section 784.046(2)(c), F.S., requires the petitioner to either be the victim of sexual violence, or a parent or legal guardian of a child victim living at home provided that the petitioner reported the sexual violence to a law enforcement agency and is cooperating in a criminal proceeding against the respondent or that the respondent was sentenced to prison for the sexual violence and the term of imprisonment has, or is about to expire within 90 days after the filing of the petition.

²⁵ *H.K. by & Through Colton v. Vocelle*, 667 So. 2d 892 (Fla. 4th DCA 1996).

²⁶ Sections 741.30(1) and 784.046(2), F.S.

²⁷ Sections 741.30(2)(c)2, and 784.046(3)(a), F.S.

- An indication that minor children reside with the petitioner or that the petitioner needs the exclusive use and possession of the dwelling that is shared with the respondent; and
- The address of the petitioner.²⁸

The form addresses whether the petitioner seeks an injunction providing a temporary parenting plan, including a temporary time-sharing schedule and temporary support for minor children.²⁹

The form for the petition for injunction provides language authorizing a petitioner to provide his or her address to the court in a separate confidential filing, if necessary for safety reasons.³⁰ The clerk of the court must, to the extent possible, ensure the petitioner's privacy while completing the form for injunction for protection against domestic violence.³¹

A similar form, though more streamlined, is authorized for a petition for injunction for protection against repeat violence, sexual violence, or dating violence.³² A petitioner may file a separate confidential filing of his or her address, just as for petitions based on domestic violence.³³

Service of the Petition

The clerk of the court must furnish a copy of the petition, notice of hearing, and temporary injunction, if any, to the sheriff or law enforcement agency of the county where the respondent resides or can be found.³⁴ The sheriff or other law enforcement agency must then personally serve the respondent the petition and other documents as soon as possible.³⁵

The Court Process

Upon the filing of the petition, the court must hold a hearing as soon as possible.³⁶ If the court determines that an immediate and present danger of violence exists, the court may grant a temporary injunction. The temporary injunction may be granted in an ex parte hearing, pending a full hearing.³⁷ A temporary injunction is effective only for a period of up to 15 days, during which time the court generally must hold a full hearing.³⁸

²⁸ Section 741.30(3)(b), F.S.

²⁹ *Id.*

³⁰ *Id.*

³¹ Section 741.30(2)(c)4., F.S.

³² Section 784.046(4)(b), F.S., requires the petition to include the residential address of the respondent, a description of the violence perpetrated by the respondent, and an affirmation that the petitioner genuinely fears repeat violence by the respondent.

³³ *Id.*

³⁴ Sections 741.30(8)(a)1., and 784.046(8)(a)1., F.S.

³⁵ Section 741.30(4), F.S.

³⁶ Sections 741.30(4) and 784.046(5), F.S.

³⁷ Sections 741.30(5)(a) and 784.046(6)(a), F.S. A temporary injunction is authorized in instances in which it appears to the court that an immediate and present danger of violence exists. If so, the court, may grant a temporary injunction at an ex parte hearing. Sections 741.30(5)(a) and 784.046(6)(a), F.S.

³⁸ Sections 741.30(5)(c) and 784.046(5)(c), F.S.

Service of the Injunction for Petition

Within 24 hours after the court issues an injunction for protection, the clerk of the court must forward a copy of the injunction to the sheriff to serve the petitioner.³⁹ Within 24 hours after the injunction is served on the respondent, the law enforcement officer must forward the written proof of service of process to the sheriff who has jurisdiction over the residence of the petitioner.⁴⁰

Public Records Exemptions and Protections from Disclosure of Contact Information

A general public records exemption protects from disclosure any document that reveals the identity, home or employment telephone number, home or employment address, or personal assets of the victim of a crime.⁴¹ In addition to this general exemption, other public records exemptions protect the contact information of a petitioner who files a petition for an injunction for protection.

Separate Confidential Filing of Address with Injunction for Protective

The exemption that protects the contact information of a petitioner seeking an injunction applies if the person, for safety reasons, submits his or her address to the court in a separate confidential filing.⁴²

Address Confidentiality Program

The Legislature enacted the Address Confidentiality Program (Program) to protect a victim of domestic violence by keeping his or her address confidential.⁴³ The program allows:

[a]n adult person, a parent or guardian acting on behalf of a minor, or a guardian acting on behalf of a person adjudicated incapacitated [to] apply to the Attorney General to have an address designated by the Attorney General serve as the person's address or the address of the minor or incapacitated person.⁴⁴

An application must include all of the following:

- A sworn statement by the applicant that the applicant has good reason to believe that the applicant, minor, or incapacitated person is a victim of domestic violence in fear of his or her safety.
- A designation of the Attorney General as agent for purposes of service of process and receipt of mail.

³⁹ Sections 741.30(8)(c)1., and 784.046(8)(c)1., F.S. The Legislature created both a Domestic and Repeat Violence Injunction Statewide Verification System and a Domestic, Dating, Sexual and Repeat Violence Injunction Statewide System (Systems) within the Florida Department of Law Enforcement (FDLE). The Systems require the FDLE to maintain a statewide communication system to electronically transmit information on protective injunctions to and between criminal justice agencies. Sections 741.30(8)(b), and 784.046(8)(b), F.S.

⁴⁰ Sections 741.30(8)(c)2., and 784.046(8)(c)2., F.S.

⁴¹ Section 119.071(2)(j)1., F.S.

⁴² The language authorizing a petitioner to submit his or her address in a separate confidential filing is contained in the actual petition form provided in sections 741.30(3)(b) and 784.046(4)(b), F.S.

⁴³ Section 741.403, F.S. Victims of stalking or aggravated stalking are also eligible to receive the benefit of the Address Confidentiality Program (s. 741.4651, F.S.).

⁴⁴ Section 741.403(1), F.S.

- The mailing address where the applicant can be contacted by the Attorney General and the phone number or numbers where the applicant can be called by the Attorney General.
- A statement that the new address that the applicant requests must not be disclosed as disclosure will increase the risk of domestic violence.
- The signature of the applicant, and any person who assisted with the application, and the date of signature.⁴⁵

A public records exemption for the Program makes exempt from disclosure addresses, telephone numbers, and social security numbers of program participants.⁴⁶ A limited exception authorizes disclosure of the information:

- To a law enforcement agency to assist in executing a valid arrest warrant;
- If directed by a court order, including to a person identified in the order; or
- After the certification has been cancelled.⁴⁷

The public records exemption under the Program also protects contact information for participants maintained by the supervisor of elections and the Department of State in voter registration and voting records. An exception is provided for disclosure to:

- A law enforcement agency to assist in serving an arrest warrant; or
- A person identified in a court order, if directed by the court order.⁴⁸

The Office of the Attorney General provides training on the availability of the Program to local governments and non-profit organizations. The office estimates that it has trained individuals from approximately 100 local entities or organizations.⁴⁹

Automated Process for the Clerk of the Court

In 2011, the Legislature required the Florida Association of Court Clerks and Comptrollers to establish, subject to available funding, an automated process to provide notice to a petitioner that the injunction for protection has been served on the respondent.⁵⁰ Once the automated process is established, the petitioner may request an automated notice that the protective injunction has been served on the respondent. The notice will be sent within 12 hours after service and include the date, time, and location where the officer served the injunction.

⁴⁵ Section 741.403(1)(a) through (e), F.S.

⁴⁶ Section 741.465(1), F.S.

⁴⁷ *Id.*

⁴⁸ Section 741.465(2), F.S.

⁴⁹ The Office of the Attorney General notes that 1,176 victims of domestic violence, stalking, or aggravated stalking are currently participating in the Program. Under the Program, participants may use a mailing address established by the office. Mail received at the office for a participant is diverted to the Office of Victim Services, which then forwards the mail to an address of the participant. Once a person qualifies to participate, based on the office finding a reasonable belief that domestic violence, stalking, or aggravated stalking has occurred, the person may receive services for up to 4 years. After that time, the person may reapply for another 4-year eligibility. Email and phone conference with Andrew Fay, Office of the Attorney General (Aug. 16, 2017).

⁵⁰ Chapter 2011-187 (CS/CS HB 563); Sections 741.30(8)(c)5.a., and 784.046(8)(c)5.a., F.S.

In 2012, the Legislature created a public records exemption relating to the automated process to protect the petitioner's contact information listed on the request to receive an automated notice.⁵¹ The specific information protected from disclosure includes the petitioner's:

- Home, cellular, or employment telephone number;
- Home or employment address;
- Electronic mail address; or
- Other electronic means of identification.⁵²

The exemption protects the contact information from disclosure for 5 years.

In its statement of public necessity justifying the exemption, the Legislature explained that the contact information,

if publicly available, could expose the victims of domestic violence, repeat violence, sexual violence, and dating violence to public humiliation and shame and could inhibit the victim from availing herself or himself of relief provided under state law. Additionally ... it could be used by the partner or former partner of the victim of domestic violence, repeat violence, sexual violence, or dating violence to determine the location of the victim, thus placing the victim in jeopardy.⁵³

In 2017, the Legislature reviewed the exemptions in this bill pursuant to the Open Government Sunset Review Act.⁵⁴ As a result of the review, the Legislature delayed the automatic repeal of the exemption by 1 year to October 2, 2018.⁵⁵

III. Effect of Proposed Changes:

This bill is based on a review by the staff of the Senate Judiciary Committee of two public records exemptions that are scheduled for repeal on October 2, 2018. The exemptions protect from public disclosure the contact information of a petitioner who requests an automated notice of the service of an injunction for protection against domestic violence, or repeat, sexual, or dating violence.

The Florida Association of Court Clerks and Comptrollers has not yet implemented the automated notification system.⁵⁶ Regardless, the justification for the exemption as is stated in the public necessity statement of the original public records bill remains valid. Additionally, other public records exemptions protect the contact information of a petitioner of an injunction for domestic violence, or repeat, sexual, or dating violence. For these reasons, the bill repeals the automatic repeal of the public records exemptions provided in ss. 741.30(8)(c)5.b. and 784.046(8)(c)5.b., F.S.

⁵¹ Chapter 2012-154, L.O.F. (HB 1193).

⁵² Sections 741.30(8)(c)5.b., and 784.046(8)(c)5.b., F.S.

⁵³ Chapter 2012-154, L.O.F.

⁵⁴ See SPB 7028 (2017).

⁵⁵ Chapter 2017-65 L.O.F.

⁵⁶ The Florida Association of Court Clerks and Comptroller say that although planning for the development of the new system continues, the system has not yet been developed. E-mail from Melvin Cox, forwarded by Fred Baggett, Sept. 26, 2017.

By repealing the automatic repeal of the exemptions, the exemptions are no longer subject to a review under the Open Government Sunset Review Act, unless the exemptions are broadened or expanded.

The bill takes effect October 1, 2018.

IV. Constitutional Issues:

A. Municipality/County Mandates Restrictions:

The bill does not appear to require counties or municipalities to spend funds or take an action requiring the expenditure of funds, reduce the authority that counties or municipalities have to raise revenues in the aggregate, or reduce the percentage of state tax shared with counties or municipalities.

B. Public Records/Open Meetings Issues:

This bill continues a current exemption but does not expand the scope of an existing public records exemption. Therefore, a simple majority vote of the members present and voting in each house of the Legislature is required for passage.

C. Trust Funds Restrictions:

None.

V. Fiscal Impact Statement:

A. Tax/Fee Issues:

None.

B. Private Sector Impact:

None.

C. Government Sector Impact:

None.

VI. Technical Deficiencies:

None.

VII. Related Issues:

Current law requires automated notice to be provided to a petitioner who has requested notification within 12 hours after the law enforcement officer has served the injunction upon the

respondent.⁵⁷ Representatives from the clerks of the court and the Florida Sheriffs Association indicate that the 12-hour requirement may be impossible to meet, given that a delay exists between the time a law enforcement officer serves a respondent and delivers a copy of the served petition to the clerk. Moreover, if a law enforcement officer serves an injunction just before the weekend, a clerk may not be able to input the information on the Comprehensive Case Information System until the following week. These potential causes of delays in providing notifications may be resolved with the activation of the CCIS, particularly if law enforcement agencies are granted access to the system to upload notice that an injunction has been served, which will then cause an automated notice to be sent to the petitioner. If law enforcement agencies are not given access to CCIS, the Legislature may wish to revise the 12-hour requirement after the CCIS is implemented.

VIII. Statutes Affected:

This bill amends the following sections of the Florida Statutes: 741.30 and 784.046.

IX. Additional Information:

- A. **Committee Substitute – Statement of Changes:**
(Summarizing differences between the Committee Substitute and the prior version of the bill.)

None.

- B. **Amendments:**

None.

This Senate Bill Analysis does not reflect the intent or official position of the bill's introducer or the Florida Senate.

⁵⁷ Sections 741.30(8)(c)5.a., and 784.046(8)(c)5.a., F.S., provide, “The automated notice shall be made within 12 hours after the sheriff or other law enforcement officer serves the injunction upon the respondent.”