

The Florida Senate
BILL ANALYSIS AND FISCAL IMPACT STATEMENT

(This document is based on the provisions contained in the legislation as of the latest date listed below.)

Prepared By: The Professional Staff of the Committee on Governmental Oversight and Accountability

BILL: CS/SB 418

INTRODUCER: Governmental Oversight and Accountability Committee and Senator Burgess

SUBJECT: Public Records/Persons Seeking Shelter

DATE: April 6, 2021 **REVISED:** _____

	ANALYST	STAFF DIRECTOR	REFERENCE	ACTION
1.	<u>Stallard</u>	<u>Caldwell</u>	<u>MS</u>	Favorable
2.	<u>Candelaria</u>	<u>McVaney</u>	<u>GO</u>	Fav/CS
3.	_____	_____	<u>RC</u>	_____

Please see Section IX. for Additional Information:
COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTE - Substantial Changes

I. Summary:

CS/SB 418 exempts from public inspection and copying requirements the address and telephone number of a person which are held by an agency providing public emergency shelter to the person during a storm or catastrophic event.

The bill provides that the exemption created under the bill is subject to the Open Government Sunset Review Act in accordance with s. 119.15, F.S., and will be repealed on October 2, 2026, unless reviewed and saved from repeal by the Legislature.

The bill provides a statement of public necessity as required by the State Constitution, providing that the exemption is necessary to limit the amount of privacy a person must forfeit by choosing to enter a shelter, and to protect a person from those who might seek to exploit their vulnerability following a catastrophic event.

Because the bill creates a new public records exemption, it requires a two-thirds vote of the members present and voting in each house of the Legislature for final passage.

The bill is not expected to impact state or local government revenues and expenditures. See Section V. Fiscal Impact Statement.

The bill takes effect upon becoming a law.

II. Present Situation:

Access to Public Records - Generally

The Florida Constitution provides that the public has the right to inspect or copy records made or received in connection with official governmental business.¹ The right to inspect or copy applies to the official business of any public body, officer, or employee of the state, including all three branches of state government, local governmental entities, and any person acting on behalf of the government.²

Additional requirements and exemptions related to public records are found in various statutes and rules, depending on the branch of government involved. For instance, s. 11.0431, F.S., provides public access requirements for legislative records. Relevant exemptions are codified in s. 11.0431(2)-(3), F.S., and the statutory provisions are adopted in the rules of each house of the legislature.³ Florida Rule of Judicial Administration 2.420 governs public access to judicial branch records.⁴ Lastly, chapter 119, F.S., provides requirements for public records held by executive agencies.

Executive Agency Records – The Public Records Act

Chapter 119, F.S., known as the Public Records Act, provides that all state, county, and municipal records are open for personal inspection and copying by any person, and that providing access to public records is a duty of each agency.⁵

A public record includes virtually any document or recording, regardless of its physical form or how it may be transmitted.⁶ The Florida Supreme Court has interpreted the statutory definition of “public record” to include “material prepared in connection with official agency business which is intended to perpetuate, communicate, or formalize knowledge of some type.”⁷

The Florida Statutes specify conditions under which public access to public records must be provided. The Public Records Act guarantees every person’s right to inspect and copy any public record at any reasonable time, under reasonable conditions, and under supervision by the

¹ FLA. CONST. art. I, s. 24(a).

² *Id.*

³ See Rule 1.48, *Rules and Manual of the Florida Senate*, (2018-2020) and Rule 14.1, *Rules of the Florida House of Representatives*, Edition 2, (2018-2020)

⁴ *State v. Wooten*, 260 So. 3d 1060 (Fla. 4th DCA 2018).

⁵ Section 119.01(1), F.S. Section 119.011(2), F.S., defines “agency” as “any state, county, district, authority, or municipal officer, department, division, board, bureau, commission, or other separate unit of government created or established by law including, for the purposes of this chapter, the Commission on Ethics, the Public Service Commission, and the Office of Public Counsel, and any other public or private agency, person, partnership, corporation, or business entity acting on behalf of any public agency.”

⁶ Section 119.011(12), F.S., defines “public record” to mean “all documents, papers, letters, maps, books, tapes, photographs, films, sound recordings, data processing software, or other material, regardless of the physical form, characteristics, or means of transmission, made or received pursuant to law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business by any agency.”

⁷ *Shevin v. Byron, Harless, Schaffer, Reid and Assoc., Inc.*, 379 So. 2d 633, 640 (Fla. 1980).

custodian of the public record.⁸ A violation of the Public Records Act may result in civil or criminal liability.⁹

The Legislature may exempt public records from public access requirements by passing a general law by a two-thirds vote of both the House and the Senate.¹⁰ The exemption must state with specificity the public necessity justifying the exemption and must be no broader than necessary to accomplish the stated purpose of the exemption.¹¹

General exemptions from the public records requirements are contained in the Public Records Act.¹² Specific exemptions often are placed in the substantive statutes relating to a particular agency or program.¹³

When creating a public records exemption, the Legislature may provide that a record is “exempt” or “confidential and exempt.” Custodians of records designated as “exempt” are not prohibited from disclosing the record; rather, the exemption means that the custodian cannot be compelled to disclose the record.¹⁴ Custodians of records designated as “confidential and exempt” may not disclose the record except under circumstances specifically defined by the Legislature.¹⁵

Open Government Sunset Review Act

The Open Government Sunset Review Act¹⁶ (the Act) prescribes a legislative review process for newly created or substantially amended¹⁷ public records or open meetings exemptions, with specified exceptions.¹⁸ It requires the automatic repeal of such exemption on October 2nd of the fifth year after creation or substantial amendment, unless the Legislature reenacts the exemption.¹⁹

The Act provides that a public records or open meetings exemption may be created or maintained only if it serves an identifiable public purpose and is no broader than is necessary.²⁰

⁸ Section 119.07(1)(a), F.S.

⁹ Section 119.10, F.S. Public records laws are found throughout the Florida Statutes, as are the penalties for violating those laws.

¹⁰ FLA. CONST. art. I, s. 24(c).

¹¹ *Id. See, e.g., Halifax Hosp. Medical Center v. News-Journal Corp.*, 724 So. 2d 567 (Fla. 1999) (holding that a public meetings exemption was unconstitutional because the statement of public necessity did not define important terms and did not justify the breadth of the exemption); *Baker County Press, Inc. v. Baker County Medical Services, Inc.*, 870 So. 2d 189 (Fla. 1st DCA 2004) (holding that a statutory provision written to bring another party within an existing public records exemption is unconstitutional without a public necessity statement).

¹² *See, e.g., s. 119.071(1)(a), F.S.* (exempting from public disclosure examination questions and answer sheets of examinations administered by a governmental agency for the purpose of licensure).

¹³ *See, e.g., s. 213.053(2)(a), F.S.* (exempting from public disclosure information contained in tax returns received by the Department of Revenue).

¹⁴ *See Williams v. City of Minneola*, 575 So. 2d 683, 687 (Fla. 5th DCA 1991).

¹⁵ *WFTV, Inc. v. The School Board of Seminole*, 874 So. 2d 48 (Fla. 5th DCA 2004).

¹⁶ Section 119.15, F.S.

¹⁷ An exemption is considered to be substantially amended if it is expanded to include more records or information or to include meetings as well as records. Section 119.15(4)(b), F.S.

¹⁸ Section 119.15(2)(a) and (b), F.S., provide that exemptions that are required by federal law or are applicable solely to the Legislature or the State Court System are not subject to the Open Government Sunset Review Act.

¹⁹ Section 119.15(3), F.S.

²⁰ Section 119.15(6)(b), F.S.

An exemption serves an identifiable purpose if it meets one of the following purposes *and* the Legislature finds that the purpose of the exemption outweighs open government policy and cannot be accomplished without the exemption:

- It allows the state or its political subdivisions to effectively and efficiently administer a governmental program, and administration would be significantly impaired without the exemption;²¹
- It protects sensitive, personal information, the release of which would be defamatory, cause unwarranted damage to the good name or reputation of the individual, or would jeopardize the individual's safety. If this public purpose is cited as the basis of an exemption, however, only personal identifying information is exempt;²² or
- It protects information of a confidential nature concerning entities, such as trade or business secrets.²³

The Act also requires specified questions to be considered during the review process.²⁴ In examining an exemption, the Act directs the Legislature to carefully question the purpose and necessity of reenacting the exemption.

If the exemption is continued and expanded, then a public necessity statement and a two-thirds vote for passage are required.²⁵ If the exemption is continued without substantive changes or if the exemption is continued and narrowed, then a public necessity statement and a two-thirds vote for passage are *not* required. If the Legislature allows an exemption to sunset, the previously exempt records will remain exempt unless provided for by law.²⁶

Public Shelters

The Division of Emergency Management (DEM) is established in the Executive Office of the Governor to serve as the state's emergency management agency.²⁷ The State Emergency Management Act²⁸ directs the DEM to oversee and manage emergency preparedness, response, recovery, and mitigation programs in Florida.

The DEM currently manages a program for surveying existing public and private buildings, with the owner's written agreement, to identify which facilities are appropriately designed and located

²¹ Section 119.15(6)(b)1., F.S.

²² Section 119.15(6)(b)2., F.S.

²³ Section 119.15(6)(b)3., F.S.

²⁴ Section 119.15(6)(a), F.S. The specified questions are:

- What specific records or meetings are affected by the exemption?
- Whom does the exemption uniquely affect, as opposed to the general public?
- What is the identifiable public purpose or goal of the exemption?
- Can the information contained in the records or discussed in the meeting be readily obtained by alternative means? If so, how?
- Is the record or meeting protected by another exemption?
- Are there multiple exemptions for the same type of record or meeting that it would be appropriate to merge?

²⁵ See generally s. 119.15, F.S.

²⁶ Section 119.15(7), F.S.

²⁷ Section 14.2016, F.S.

²⁸ Section 252.31, F.S., through s. 252.60, F.S., are known as the State Emergency Management Act. Section 252.31, F.S.

to serve as shelters in the event of an emergency.²⁹ Public facilities, including schools, post-secondary education facilities, and other facilities owned or leased by the state or local governments, but excluding hospitals or nursing homes, suitable for use as public hurricane evacuation shelters must be made available at the request of the local emergency management agencies.³⁰

The DEM is required to prepare a state comprehensive emergency management plan (CEMP) that must be integrated into, and coordinated with, the emergency management plans of the Federal Government.³¹ The CEMP³² must include a shelter component, the Statewide Emergency Shelter Plan (plan),³³ with specific planning provisions and the CEMP must promote shelter activity coordination between the public, private, and nonprofit sectors.³⁴ The plan must include the following:

- Contain strategies to ensure the availability of adequate shelter space in each region of the state;
- Establish strategies for refuge-of-last-resort programs;
- Provide strategies to assist local emergency management efforts to ensure that adequate staffing plans exist for all shelters, including medical and security personnel;
- Provide for a post-disaster communications system for public shelters;
- Establish model shelter guidelines for operations, registration, inventory, power generation capability, information management, and staffing; and
- Set forth policy guidance for sheltering people with special needs.³⁵

The plan must be prepared and submitted to the Governor and Cabinet each even-numbered year.³⁶ The plan, among other requirements, must identify the location and square footage of existing shelters as well as shelters needed in the next five years.³⁷ The plan must also identify the types of public facilities that should be constructed to comply with emergency shelter criteria and must recommend an appropriate and available source of funding for the additional cost of constructing emergency shelters within these public facilities.³⁸

Public shelters are not required to gather personal information on shelter residents, however, nothing in law prevents the collection of this information. Shelters that collect personal information on their residents may do so to have an accurate accounting of all persons staying within or to locate family members for the purpose of family reunification. While no public

²⁹ Section 252.385(2)(a), F.S.

³⁰ Section 252.385(4)(a), F.S.

³¹ Section 252.35(2)(a), F.S.; *see also* s. 1013.372, F.S.

³² FLA. ADMIN. CODE R. 27P-2.002, incorporates the CEMP by reference; *See* Comprehensive Emergency Management Plan, Division of Emergency Management, available at <https://www.floridadisaster.org/globalassets/importedpdfs/2014-state-cemp-basic-plan.pdf> (last visited January 27, 2021).

³³ 2018 Statewide Emergency Shelter Plan, DIVISION OF EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, available at <https://www.floridadisaster.org/globalassets/dem/response/sesp/2018/2018-sesp-entire-document.pdf> (last visited January 27, 2021).

³⁴ Section 252.35(2)(a)2., F.S.

³⁵ *Id.*

³⁶ Section 1013.372(2), F.S.

³⁷ *Id.*

³⁸ *Id.*

record exemption for this information exists, the plan states that shelter staff members should “abide by principles of confidentiality.”³⁹

III. Effect of Proposed Changes:

Section 1 amends s. 252.385, F.S., to exempt⁴⁰ from public inspection and copying requirements the address and telephone number of a person which are held by an agency, as defined in s. 119.011, F.S., providing public emergency shelter to person during a storm or catastrophic event.

The bill provides that the exemptions are subject to the Open Government Sunset Review Act and will repeal October 2, 2026, unless the Legislature reviews and reenacts the exemptions by that date.

Section 2 provides a public necessity statement as required by the Florida Constitution. The statement asserts that:

Shelters are made available to the public to provide a safe place of accommodation before, during, and immediately following an emergency. During an emergency, the people affected are in a vulnerable state, as they have voluntarily displaced themselves from their residences and possessions to seek refuge. The information submitted to an agency by such a person seeking shelter could be used by persons seeking to take advantage of their vulnerability during or following the emergency. In addition, people seeking shelter for their safety and the safety of their families should not be forced to forfeit their privacy for the sake of such safety.

Section 3 provides that the bill takes effect upon becoming a law.

IV. Constitutional Issues:

A. Municipality/County Mandates Restrictions:

Not applicable. The mandate restrictions do not apply because the bill does not require counties and municipalities to spend funds, reduce counties’ or municipalities’ ability to raise revenue, or reduce the percentage of state tax shared with counties and municipalities.

³⁹ *Supra*, note 33 at Appendix F, pg. F-2.

⁴⁰ There is a difference between records the Legislature designates exempt from public records requirements and those the Legislature deems confidential and exempt. A record classified as exempt from public disclosure may be disclosed under certain circumstances. *See Williams v. City of Minneola*, 575 So. 2d 683, 687 (Fla. 5th DCA 1991) *review denied*, 589 So. 2d 289 (Fla. 1991). If the Legislature designates a record as confidential and exempt from public disclosure, such record may not be released by the custodian of public records to anyone other than the persons or entities specifically designated in statute. *See WFTV, Inc. v. Sch. Bd. of Seminole Cnty*, 874 So. 2d 48, 53 (Fla. 5th DCA 2004), *review denied*, 892 So. 2d 1015 (Fla. 2004); Op. Att’y Gen. Fla. 85-692 (1985).

B. Public Records/Open Meetings Issues:***Vote Requirement***

Article I, s. 24(c) of the State Constitution requires a two-thirds vote of the members present and voting for final passage of a bill creating or expanding an exemption to the public records requirements. This bill enacts a new exemption for the address and telephone number of a person which are held by an agency providing public emergency shelter to the person during a storm or catastrophic event. Thus, the bill requires a two-thirds vote to be enacted.

Public Necessity Statement

Article I, s. 24(c) of the State Constitution requires a bill creating or expanding an exemption to the public records requirements to state with specificity the public necessity justifying the exemption. Section 2 of the bill contains a statement of public necessity for the exemption.

Breadth of Exemption

Article I, s. 24(c) of the State Constitution requires an exemption to the public records requirements to be no broader than necessary to accomplish the stated purpose of the law. The purpose of the law is to protect the address and telephone number of a person using a public shelter provided by an agency during a storm or catastrophic event. This bill exempts only the address and telephone number of a person using a public shelter provided by an agency during a storm or catastrophic event from the public records requirements. The exemption does not appear to be broader than necessary to accomplish the purpose of the law.

C. Trust Funds Restrictions:

None.

D. State Tax or Fee Increases:

None.

E. Other Constitutional Issues:

None identified.

V. Fiscal Impact Statement:**A. Tax/Fee Issues:**

None.

B. Private Sector Impact:

None.

C. Government Sector Impact:

An agency may incur a minimal fiscal impact associated with training staff responsible for complying with public records requests related to the creation of the public records exemptions. Costs associated with redacting the exempt information prior to releasing a record may be incurred. The costs, however, would be absorbed within existing resources, as they are part of day-to-day responsibilities.

VI. Technical Deficiencies:

None.

VII. Related Issues:

None.

VIII. Statutes Affected:

This bill substantially amends section 252.385, Florida Statutes.

IX. Additional Information:

- A. Committee Substitute – Statement of Substantial Changes:**
(Summarizing differences between the Committee Substitute and the prior version of the bill.)

CS by Governmental Oversight and Accountability on April 6, 2021:

The CS removes the “name” of a person seeking shelter from the public records exemption and revises the public necessity statement to align it with the exempted information. The CS establishes that the exempted information is for a person provided public emergency shelter during a storm or catastrophic event. The CS removes all references to the term “assistance” throughout the bill.

- B. Amendments:**

None.