

By Senator Martin

33-00072A-26

202618__

A bill to be entitled

An act for the relief of the Estate of M.N. by the Broward County Sheriff's Office; providing an appropriation to compensate the estate for injuries sustained by M.N. and her subsequent death as a result of the negligence of the Broward County Sheriff's Office; providing a limitation on compensation and the payment of attorney fees; providing an effective date.

WHEREAS, Keshia Walsh and Christopher Nevarez were parents to M.N., born on April 20, 2016, and to D.N., born on February 2, 2012, and

WHEREAS, on August 19, 2016, Ms. Walsh brought M.N., then 3 months old, to Broward Health Medical Center reporting that M.N. had fallen from a couch and sustained a black eye while they were at the home of Juan Santos, where Ms. Walsh and M.N. were living at the time, and

WHEREAS, Mr. Nevarez and Ms. Walsh brought M.N. to a follow-up pediatrician appointment pursuant to follow-up care instructions from Broward Health Medical Center, and

WHEREAS, at the follow-up visit, Mr. Nevarez questioned the doctor as to whether M.N. could have sustained her injuries as the result of a fall, and the doctor responded that it was possible, and

WHEREAS, on October 13, 2016, Ms. Walsh brought 5-month-old M.N. to Northwest Medical Center, in Broward County, with a fever and intermittent leg pain, and

WHEREAS, diagnostic imaging revealed that M.N. had multiple fractures in her upper and lower extremities which were in

33-00072A-26

202618__

different stages of healing, including fractures to her left tibia, left fibula, and left radius, which Ms. Walsh had no explanation for, and

WHEREAS, the treating physician consulted with a pediatric orthopedic specialist who, upon reviewing M.N.'s diagnostic imaging, advised that the fractures appeared to be non-accidental and recommended that her injuries be reported to the Florida Abuse Hotline overseen by the Department of Children and Families, and

WHEREAS, a report was made to the Florida Abuse Hotline and was assigned to the Broward County Sheriff's Office (BSO), the agency responsible for child protective investigations in Broward County, and

WHEREAS, a BSO child protective investigator (CPI) responded to the hospital, observed the injuries, learned that they were unexplained and occurred under the care of Ms. Walsh while living with Mr. Santos, and noted that Ms. Walsh had previously taken M.N. to multiple facilities for treatment for various injuries, including the prior black eye, and

WHEREAS, Mr. Nevarez had been an active parent in M.N.'s life; however, Ms. Walsh cut off contact with Mr. Nevarez in mid-September 2016, and refused to tell him where she and M.N. were living, and

WHEREAS, Mr. Nevarez was the non-offending parent, meaning he had no role in causing or failing to prevent M.N.'s injuries, Mr. Nevarez was required to be the first person contacted by the BSO during the investigation, and, if contact was initially unsuccessful, the BSO was required to make daily attempts to contact Mr. Nevarez, and

33-00072A-26

202618__

59 WHEREAS, the BSO failed to contact Mr. Navarez immediately,
60 failed to notify him that M.N. had multiple unexplained
61 fractures in different stages of healing, failed to immediately
62 place M.N. with Mr. Nevarez for her protection, and failed to
63 make daily attempts to contact Mr. Nevarez, and

64 WHEREAS, when an abuse investigation is initiated at a
65 hospital emergency room, the CPI is required to consult with the
66 attending physician to determine whether the injury is the
67 result of maltreatment and immediately contact the Child
68 Protective Team (CPT) in person or by phone to discuss all
69 reports of fractures in a child of any age; however, the BSO
70 failed to consult with the attending physician and failed to
71 contact the CPT from the hospital, and

72 WHEREAS, during an abuse investigation, the BSO's
73 assessment of the safety and perceived needs of the child and
74 family must include a face-to-face interview with the child,
75 other siblings, parents, and other adults in the household;
76 however, the BSO failed to interview Mr. Santos, and

77 WHEREAS, the BSO is required to review the prior criminal
78 history of parents and caregivers and complete a criminal
79 history check within 24 hours of an individual's identity and
80 presence in the home becoming known to the investigator;
81 however, the BSO failed to complete a background check on Mr.
82 Santos, and

83 WHEREAS, despite the BSO's actual knowledge of a pattern of
84 unexplained injuries to M.N., M.N.'s three unexplained diagnosed
85 fractures, and the CPI's personal observations of bruising
86 around M.N.'s eye and discoloration on M.N.'s left wrist, the
87 CPI did not suspect abuse, found that there was no present

33-00072A-26

202618__

88 danger or threat to M.N., allowed M.N. to be discharged from the
89 hospital into Ms. Walsh's custody, and implemented a Safety Plan
90 for M.N. to remain in Ms. Walsh's care with no further
91 investigation into how M.N. sustained her injuries, and

92 WHEREAS, on October 18, 2016, the BSO supervisor instructed
93 the CPI to obtain the medical file from M.N.'s August hospital
94 visit, obtain collateral information from neighbors, and refer
95 daycare services to Ms. Walsh, and

96 WHEREAS, the CPI's chronological case notes do not reflect
97 any activity on the investigation into M.N.'s injuries after
98 these directives, and

99 WHEREAS, the BSO also failed to review M.N.'s medical file,
100 have M.N. seen by CPT, interview any third-parties, including
101 family, friends, and neighbors, and ensure M.N. was enrolled in
102 daycare, and

103 WHEREAS, Ann McClain, M.N.'s paternal grandmother, with
104 whom M.N. and Ms. Walsh previously resided until Ms. Walsh
105 abruptly left the home in mid-September 2016 with M.N.,
106 maintained some contact via text messages with Ms. Walsh, but
107 could not discover where Ms. Walsh and M.N. were living, and

108 WHEREAS, Mr. Nevarez repeatedly tried to see M.N. and find
109 out where she was living by texting Ms. Walsh, going to Ms.
110 Walsh's place of employment, contacting Ms. Walsh's relatives
111 and friends, and going to D.N.'s daycare, but Ms. Walsh ignored
112 his repeated requests to see M.N., and

113 WHEREAS, on October 24, 2016, while the BSO's child
114 protective investigation was still open, M.N. sustained life-
115 threatening injuries including a parietal skull fracture, brain
116 and spinal cord trauma, retinal hemorrhages, and two femur

33-00072A-26

202618__

fractures due to abuse while in the care of Ms. Walsh and Mr. Santos, and

WHEREAS, M.N. was transported to the hospital and declared brain dead that same day, placed on life support, and died on October 28, 2016, and

WHEREAS, the BSO closed its investigation into M.N.'s abuse on July 17, 2017, with verified findings of bone fractures, internal injuries, threatened harm, and death, and

WHEREAS, the BSO placed D.N. in Mr. Nevarez's care, implemented a safety plan preventing Ms. Walsh from having contact with D.N., and Ms. Walsh's parental rights to D.N. were terminated on June 20, 2018, at the BSO's request, and

WHEREAS, but for the BSO's negligence in failing to reasonably investigate allegations of abuse of M.N., and failing to remove M.N. from Ms. Walsh and Mr. Santos' care, the injuries sustained during the BSO's investigation and M.N.'s death would not have occurred, and

WHEREAS, in August 2023, the case was tried in the 17th Judicial Circuit Court of Broward County, and

WHEREAS, the BSO admitted negligence at trial, and the jury found that M.N.'s death and Mr. Nevarez's loss were due to BSO's failure to conduct a thorough child protective investigation and ensure M.N.'s safety, and

WHEREAS, the court awarded \$4.5 million to Mr. Nevarez, M.N.'s non-offending father, for his pain and suffering, of which \$2.61 million, or 58 percent of the fault, was attributed to BSO, and

WHEREAS, the BSO has paid \$110,000 and Broward County has paid \$90,000 for claims against the County related to CPT, which

33-00072A-26

202618__

has exhausted the sovereign immunity limits set forth in s.
768.28, Florida Statutes, and

WHEREAS, the court entered a cost judgment awarding taxable
costs in the amount of \$88,258.50 to the Estate of M.N., to be
paid by the BSO, and

WHEREAS, the Estate of M.N. is responsible for payment of
attorney fees and all remaining costs and expenses relating to
this claim, subject to the limitations set forth in this act,
and

WHEREAS, the sum of \$2,588,258.50, representing the
judgment from the verdict against the BSO in the amount of \$2.61
million plus the cost judgment entered against the BSO in the
amount of \$88,258.50, less BSO's payment of \$110,000 in
satisfaction of its portion of the sovereign immunity limits,
remains unpaid by the BSO, NOW, THEREFORE,

Be It Enacted by the Legislature of the State of Florida:

Section 1. The facts stated in the preamble to this act are
found and declared to be true.

Section 2. The Broward County Sheriff's Office is
authorized and directed to appropriate from funds not otherwise
encumbered and to draw a warrant in the sum of \$2,588,258.50
payable to the Estate of M.N. as compensation for injuries and
damages sustained.

Section 3. It is the intent of the Legislature that all
government liens, including Medicaid liens, resulting from the
treatment and care of M.N. for the occurrences described in this
act be waived and paid by the state.

33-00072A-26

202618__

175 Section 4. The amount paid by the Broward County Sheriff's
176 Office pursuant to s. 768.28, Florida Statutes, and the amount
177 awarded under this act are intended to provide the sole
178 compensation for all present and future claims arising out of
179 the factual situation described in this act which resulted in
180 injuries and damages to the Estate of M.N. The total amount paid
181 for attorney fees relating to this claim may not exceed 25
182 percent of the total amount awarded under this act.

183 Section 5. This act shall take effect upon becoming a law.